

# Alternative E

## Natural Landscape

### Geology and Minerals

#### Goals and Objectives

- Manage BENM for the protection and preservation of all geologic features and resources.

#### Management Actions Common to All Action Alternatives

- Ensure that adequate reclamation of disturbed areas is accomplished consistent with preservation, restoration, and protection of BENM objects and values.
- Agencies would collaborate with the BEC to provide permitted access, with permitting and/or alternate access processing protocols as co-defined by the BEC, to BENM minerals for traditional and/or ceremonial uses as consistent with Federal law. These permits would be managed to provide for the long-term sustainability and use of mineral resources for traditional and ceremonial uses only. Agencies would collaborate with the BEC to provide for traditional and/or cultural uses of paleontological resources.

#### MANAGEMENT ACTIONS BY ALTERNATIVE

ALTERNATIVE E
<p>Row 327- Similar to alternative B with the exception of BEC inclusion in collaboration regarding mining plan of operations</p> <p>Subject to valid existing rights, BLM and NFS lands within the BENM are withdrawn from all forms of mineral entry, location, selection, or patent under the Mining Law of 1872, and from disposition under all laws relating to mineral and geothermal leasing.</p> <p>Before approving a plan of operations within the BENM on claims located before the lands were withdrawn, the Agencies must, in accordance with 43 CFR 3809.100(a), prepare a mineral examination report to determine whether the mining claim was valid before the withdrawal, and to determine whether the mining claim remains valid. The operator would be responsible for the costs of the mineral examination, as required by 43 CFR 3800.5(b). If the Agencies conclude that a mining claim is invalid, the Agencies would not approve operations on the claim, but instead promptly initiate contest proceedings. The agencies will collaborate with the BEC regarding review of mining plans of operations to ensure that any mining or mineral extraction activity will not harm or destroy Monument objects and values. If mining</p>

or mineral leasing activities that the Agencies determine are valid and existing rights are allowed to proceed, the Agencies and the BEC would, to the greatest extent possible, and in accordance with applicable law, manage the activity in a manner that protects BENM objects and values. According to Tribal expertise and Traditional Indigenous Knowledge of the cultural landscape of the BENM, commercial mining, extraction and development is not an appropriate use of this landscape. According to the tribal expertise of the BEC, individual, non-commercial cultural use of any culturally relevant minerals for Tribal members is appropriate because it does not deplete the resources of BENM.

The Agencies and the BEC would collaborate with the Utah Division of Oil, Gas, and Mining in implementing the Abandoned Mine Reclamation Program to close access and clean up waste associated with abandoned mine lands.

Agencies would work with the BEC and Tribal Nations to identify geologic hazards that pose a risk to public health and safety and partner with appropriate agencies as applicable for remediation.

Agencies would collaborate with the BEC and the Tribal Nations of the BEC to identify and preserve unique geologic features and/or geologic features of spiritual significance. This could include closing areas with these features on a seasonal basis to protect them or to provide for traditional uses or ceremonies.

## **Paleontology**

### **Goals and Objectives**

- Protect paleontological resources in the BENM consistent with BENM objects and values and according to Traditional Indigenous Knowledge regarding the value of these resources to the BENM cultural landscape.

### **Management Actions Common to All Action Alternatives**

- Agencies would collaborate with the BEC to provide for the protection of paleontological resources consistent with preservation, restoration, and protection of BENM objects and values.
- Agencies would collaborate with the BEC to provide for traditional and/or cultural uses of paleontological resources.
- Ensure that areas that contain or are likely to contain vertebrate or invertebrate or plant fossils and their traces are identified and evaluated prior to authorizing surface-disturbing activities or opening new areas to livestock grazing.
- Identify area-wide criteria or site-specific use restrictions where necessary to protect paleontological resources from surface-disturbing activities and to promote the Tribal, scientific, educational, and recreational uses of fossils.
- All research, inventories, and monitoring of paleontological resources would be conducted in accordance with applicable Federal laws, regulations, and policy as well as

Tribal Nations of the BEC policies and protocols. Any paleontological collection for research purposes would be required to coordinate with the BEC regarding method and extent of collections with the goal of limiting fossil removal and collection from BENM.

- Research focused on erosion patterns and drivers could assist in the preservation of paleontological resources.

### Management Actions by Alternative

<b>Alternative E</b>
Row 56 - see Management Actions Common to All
<p>Row 57- Similar to alternative A with exception for Tribal use permits</p> <p>Casual collection of petrified wood by the general public would not be allowed in the BENM. Petrified wood collection is managed by the Petrified Wood Act of 1962, which established petrified wood as a mineral material under the Materials Act of 1947. The BENM has been withdrawn from all mineral entry and exploration (2020 MMP).</p> <p>Issuance of special use permits for collection of petrified wood would be allowed for traditional uses by members of culturally affiliated Tribal Nations.</p>
<p>Row 58- Same as alternative B</p> <p>As funding is available, the agencies would collaborate with the BEC to gather information on the importance of paleontological resources to Tribal Nations, where appropriate, including Traditional Indigenous Knowledge. The agencies will ensure that Traditional Indigenous Knowledge regarding paleontological resources is recognized as a management approach, together with western scientific management paradigms. Agencies would also collaborate with the BEC on the prioritization of information gathering from Tribal Nations of the BEC.</p>
<p>Row 59- Similar to alternative B with specific inclusion of the BEC</p> <p>Paleontological collection for all fossils, vertebrate and invertebrate, would be by permit only, with no allowance for commercial collection, and would be conducted in collaboration with the BEC. The permitting process, stipulations, regulations and overview would be co-designed and co-implemented by the BEC. Where agencies become aware of paleontological resources that are eroding out or otherwise becoming susceptible to impacts from recreational and other users of the Monument cultural landscape, the agencies will take steps to protect them. Before authorizing projects that could impact the stability of paleontological resources in the monument, such as seismic work, construction, or other development activities, the Agencies shall take proactive measures to protect these resources.</p>

## **Alternative E**

Row 60- Similar to alternative A

To protect paleontological resources no casual collection of any fossils would be allowed within the BENM, with the exception of culturally affiliated Tribal use by permit.

Row 61- Similar to alternative B with specific inclusion of the BEC

Prior to implementing any surface disturbing activities or discretionary actions that could impact paleontological resources, on-site surveys would be conducted for paleontological resources in all areas. The Authorized Officer (BLM)/Responsible Official (US Forest Service) has the discretion to modify these survey requirements if they determine that the modification would continue to provide for the proper care and management of BENM objects and values. This determination should include collaboration with the BEC. Traditional Ecological Knowledge and Tribal expertise requires that fossil resources should be left undisturbed. Gathering of petrified wood does not fall within this prohibition.

Row 62- Same as alternative B

Protect and preserve paleontological resources. Restoration of paleontological resources should only be done in collaboration with the BEC, due to Traditional Ecological Knowledge requiring that paleontological resources be left undisturbed. Any work done involving fossils should not be extractive; fossil resources should not be extracted from the BENM nor sent away to distant collections, including university and museum collections.

Row 64- Similar to alternative B with specific inclusion of the BEC

If surveys indicate presence of significant paleontological resources, the BLM, the US Forest Service, and the BEC would take appropriate action, case-by-case, to avoid impacts to those resources. This may require the construction of physical barriers or the determination of methods to separate the public from paleontological resources.

Row 66- Similar to alternative B with exception of blanket trail openings for public use and the inclusion of other areas that may contain significant paleontological resources

Management and development of hiking paths and trails in Shay Canyon, or in any other areas with significant paleontological resources as co-defined by the BEC and the agencies, would be consistent with maintaining BENM objects and values, including protection of significant paleontological resources.

If monitoring indicates impacts to significant paleontological resources, the BLM, may not harden trails or otherwise develop or alter sites without engaging the BEC to determine the appropriate Tribal expertise regarding the proper care and management of paleontological resources. The agencies may reroute, or close trails as necessary to protect sites, but should collaborate with the BEC regarding these actions. No new trail development would be allowed in Shay Canyon or in any other areas with significant paleontological resources as co-defined

## **Alternative E**

by the BEC and the agencies.

Education or interpretation would be provided to inform recreational users of the importance of not impacting paleontological resources.

Seasonal closures of trails and access areas to allow for resource rest would be determined in collaboration with the BEC.

ADDITIONAL TO AGENCY MATRIX - The agencies would protect paleontological resources from the harmful impacts of livestock grazing. According to Tribal expertise, paleontological resources are an essential part of the Bears Ears landscape and livestock grazing can harm that resource.

## **Soil Resources**

### **Goals and Objectives**

- Manage activities to promote sustainable soil functions and interactions with all other resources on the monument, reduce cumulative threats to soil resources, and maintain or improve soils to a suitable level of functionality, with soil properties appropriate to site-specific climate and landform and to the total functional composition of soils on the monument. Protect soil resources and all other resources that depend on them as part of the healing landscape of the Monument.
- Protect highly sensitive soils (highly sensitive to erosion) and biological soil crusts.

### **Management Actions Common to All Action Alternatives**

- Agencies will collaborate with the BEC to protect soil and water resources and provide for the long-term sustainability of soil.
- Agencies would collaborate with the BEC to maintain and/or restore overall watershed health and water quality conditions by reducing erosion, stream sedimentation, and salinization of water and ensure ecological diversity and sustainability.
- Agencies would collaborate with the BEC in identifying areas with biological soil crusts and protecting those areas. These protections could include seasonal closures of areas to visitation during drought periods and ceremonially and traditionally important times of year or permanent closures of areas with high biological soil crust density.
- Agencies would manage public lands consistent with the Colorado River Salinity Control Act and any other relative legislation or TEK-based standards as co-identified by the BEC.
- Agencies would coordinate with the Tribal Nations and BEC to monitor impacts of

discretionary uses and management actions on soil resources and collaboratively manage uses to minimize and mitigate these impacts.

## Management Actions by Alternative

<b>Alternative E</b>
Row 171- Different from alternative D  If surface-disturbing activities cannot be avoided on slopes between 21% and 30%, an erosion control plan would be required. The plan must be approved by the agencies, Tribal Nations and the BEC prior to commencement of surface-disturbing activities and include the following: <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>● An erosion control strategy.</li><li>● An agency and BEC approved survey and design of the erosion control plan.</li><li>● No surface disturbing activities would be allowed on slopes greater than 30% unless absolutely necessary to preserve, restore, and protect BENM objects and values.</li></ul>
Row 172- Same as alternative B  Implementation-level travel planning would not designate non-motorized and non-mechanized trails in sensitive soils in locations where monitoring has shown degradation to these resources, unless necessary to ensure the preservation, restoration, and protection of BENM objects and values, or unless there are no other feasible alternatives and those trails would not adversely impact the preservation, restoration, and protection of BENM objects and values.
<b>ADDITIONAL TO AGENCY MATRIX:</b>  Where biological soil crusts are impaired, apply Traditional Indigenous Knowledge and Tribal policies and guidelines, peer-reviewed literature based on the best available western science, and guidelines from Biological Soil Crusts: Ecology and Management (BLM 2001) to restore soil crusts.

ADDITIONAL TO AGENCY MATRIX:

Maintain or improve soil quality and long-term soil productivity using culturally-led standards, co-identified with the BEC, designed to benefit natural ecosystems, native species, and important relationships between water and soil.

## **Riparian, Wetland, and Water Resources**

### **Goals and Objectives**

- Manage riparian resources for properly functioning conditions (PFC), ensuring ecological diversity, stability, and sustainability, including maintaining water quantity and quality, the desired mix of vegetation types, structural stages, landscape/riparian/watershed function. Provide for native and special status plant, fish, and wildlife habitats, and Traditional, cultural, and ceremonial uses of water on BENM.
- Agencies would collaborate with the BEC to protect and restore riparian areas, wetlands, springs, seeps, and floodplains. Coordinate with the BEC to determine appropriate restrictions or improvements as necessary to preserve, restore, and protect BENM objects and values.

### **Management Actions Common to All Action Alternatives**

- Manage riparian areas for PFC and ensure stream channel morphology and functions are appropriate to the local soil type, climate, and landform.
- Develop a groundwater/ surface water monitoring plan and triggers for adaptive management if needed to protect monument objects or water resources.
- Prioritize completion of a comprehensive spring inventory of the BENM, including status of springs both active and inactive. Collaborate with the BEC to develop a spring revitalization and monitoring program and to restore and protect springs that are non-functioning and/or functioning-at-risk from impacts using implementable protection measures.
- Conduct groundwater study on Cedar Mesa Sandstone aquifer to better understand characteristics, current conditions, springs, and cumulative impacts to this aquifer.
- Prioritize the revegetation of disturbed soils with native plant species where adverse impacts including those caused by erosion would occur to aquatic and riparian ecosystems according to priorities co-designed with Tribal Nations and the BEC.
- Agencies and the BEC would manage for water flow (quality, quantity, and timing) to maintain stable and efficient stream channels and habitat function.

- Agencies would implement the management actions for water quality per the Utah Statewide Nonpoint Source Pollution Management Plan (UDEQ 2013), while also incorporating water quality standards co-defined by the BEC.
- In collaboration with the BEC, manage watersheds and natural catchments to facilitate groundwater recharge.
- Support traditional use of springs and riparian areas by Tribal Nations by protecting these resources and providing information on groundwater surveys, spring inventories, and water quality monitoring to Tribal Nations and the BEC.
- For portions of the BENM that include the Natural Bridges National Monument Groundwater Protection Zone, adopt management actions defined in the Natural Bridges National Monument Groundwater Protection Zone Plan.

### Management Actions by Alternative

<b>Alternative E</b>
<p>Row 124- Same as alternative B</p> <p>Dispersed recreation management:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Limit use where monitoring indicates that the riparian area is being impacted.</li> </ul>
<p>Row 125- Similar to alternative D</p> <p>No camping within ½ mile of perennial and/or intermittent surface waters, springs or seeps, and water protection zones unless in an existing designated camping area. Locations of camping areas that are within a ½ mile of surface waters, springs, or seeps to be evaluated by the BEC.</p> <p>Close dispersed designated camping areas near surface water bodies if camping is determined to be a causal factor in impacts to surface water body and/or riparian functions.</p>
<p>Row 128- Similar to alternative D</p> <p>No new trails would be allowed in riparian areas or 100 year floodplains. Existing trails would be maintained as necessary to protect and/or restore BENM objects and values. An inventory of existing trails and new user-created trails would be shared with the</p>

BEC.

Row 129- Different from alternative B, different from alternative C, different from alternative D

The Agencies would collaborate with the BEC to reduce tamarisk, Russian olive, other woody or herbaceous invasive species, or any other harmful invasive species and/or noxious weeds identified by the BEC where appropriate and using minimally invasive vegetation treatments. Reseed treatment areas with native plants to avoid erosion damage or the reestablishment of invasive species.

All treatments will be implemented on a seasonal basis determined in collaboration with the BEC.

The BLM and USFS will work with Tribal conservation crews to remove invasive species and reseed and transplant native vegetation.

Row 130- Similar to alternative C

Floodplains and riparian/aquatic areas are:

Subject to fire suppression if necessary to protect riparian habitat.

Excluded from private and/or commercial use of woodland products, except for culturally affiliated Tribal Nation traditional purposes.

Excluded from surface disturbance by mechanized or motorized equipment and from structural development .

All treatments will be implemented on a seasonal basis determined in collaboration with the Tribal Nations and the BEC.

Row 131- Most similar to alternative B

Harvest of cottonwood, willow, and other traditionally used plants for ceremonial uses would be allowed through either a permit system or a notification of use through a point of contact unless monitoring indicates that this harvest is adversely impacting BENM objects and values.

- Monitoring of cottonwood and willow would include population size and health inventories.
- When removing hazard trees from developed sites, Agencies would coordinate with the BEC and Tribal Nations to provide those trees for ceremonial use.
- No cutting would be allowed for shade canopies and within developed sites or areas (ex. camping areas).
- Until monitoring of cottonwood and willow populations is completed, cottonwood harvesting is limited to ¼ cord per person per year and willow harvesting is limited to 200 stems per person per year.
- Agencies would collaborate with the BEC to implement modifications to these restrictions as necessary to provide for Tribal traditional or ceremonial use while preserving, restoring, and protecting BENM objects and values.

Row 134- Same as alternative B

Manage discretionary uses to protect drinking source water protection zones.

Row 135- Different from alternative D

No livestock trailing or grazing would be allowed along the full length of riparian areas. Rehabilitate riparian areas that have been negatively affected by livestock grazing. Co-design solutions with the BEC to encourage cattle away from springs.

Row 136- Similar to alternative A

Riparian, floodplain, and wetland management: Prior to implementation of project activities and discretionary actions, delineate and evaluate riparian areas and or wetlands that may be impacted. Project-specific impacts to riparian areas, floodplains,

and wetlands would be analyzed at the site-specific level and mitigation measures would be developed and implemented as necessary in collaboration with the BEC and Tribal Nations of the BEC to prevent unnecessary and undue resource degradation.

Row 137- Similar to alternative B

Initial attack and fire suppression: Heavy equipment would not be used in riparian areas unless absolutely necessary to protect life and/or resiliency of BENM objects and values.

Row 138- Different from alternative B

No surface disturbing or discretionary activities that alter vegetative cover, result in stream channel instability or loss of channel cross sectional area, or reduce water would be allowed within 100 year floodplains or within ½ mile of riparian areas and along perennial and intermittent springs and streams unless absolutely necessary to protect and/or restore BENM objects and values.

Row 139- Similar to alternative A

If monitoring determines that a permitted activity is a causal factor in riparian areas Functioning at Risk or Nonfunctioning, steps would be taken on a case-by-case basis to mitigate the impacts of that activity or temporarily restrict the activity, or, if necessary, the riparian area would be closed seasonally to that activity to provide for rest, restoration and maintenance of riparian area PFC. In those cases where there are closures, those closures would be lifted if changes in the permitted activity provide for restoration and maintenance of riparian area PFC. Time periods for closure would be determined in collaboration with the BEC.

Row 140- Different from alternative D

Any water withdrawals or diversions would not be authorized unless absolutely necessary and approved by the BEC. Require a hydrologic study for all proposed groundwater withdrawals.

Row 141- Similar to alternative B

During implementation-level travel planning, no new routes, motorized or non-motorized, would be designated in riparian areas, 100 year floodplains, and perennial springs and seeps especially where monitoring has shown degradation, unless co-approved by the BEC and the Agencies and absolutely necessary to protect BENM objects and values.

Row 166- Similar to alternative A

Manage actions on the BENM in accordance with relevant recommendations published in the State of Utah's Total Maximum Daily Load Reports at minimum with additional water quality standards to be co-defined by the Agencies and the BEC.

Row 168- Same as alternative A

Collaborate with San Juan County, the State of Utah, Tribal governments, and local municipalities on management of municipal watersheds to meet local needs.

Row 169- Similar to alternative B

Agencies would collaborate with the BEC to stabilize perennial streambanks which are damaged beyond natural recovery in a reasonable period with appropriate methods or procedures where feasible. This includes the following:

- Rehabilitate disturbed areas, where feasible, that are eroding excessively and/or contributing significant sediment to perennial streams.
- Soil losses should be at or below the soil loss tolerance values (T-factors) as defined by the NRCS.

Avoid channelization of natural streams. Where channelization is necessary for flood control or other purposes use stream geometry relationships to reestablish meanders, width/depth ratios, etc. consistent with each major stream type. Incorporate Traditional Indigenous Knowledge and practices regarding managing natural streams and stream patterns, including the use of check dams.

Row 170- Same as alternative B

Secure favorable flows of water to:

- Ensure that stream flows maintain stable with efficient channels and to provide for administrative and protective use
- Preserve, restore, and protect BENM objects and values.
- Obtain through the State, where appropriate, water rights for consumptive uses and instream flows as needed.
- Maintain instream flows to preserve, restore, and protect BENM objects and values.
- Prohibit new or expansion of existing spring or other water source development and related facilities when;
  - It would impact the functioning condition of riparian, wetlands, and water resources.
  - It would result in unacceptable erosion, road damage, land instability, or other types of disruption or damage and it would not preserve, restore, and protect BENM objects and values.

ADDITIONAL TO AGENCY MATRIX: Minimize surface-disturbing and discretionary activities within 200 ft of riparian areas, springs or seeps and 100 year floodplains that alter vegetative cover, result in stream channel instability or loss of channel cross sectional area, or reduce water quality, unless the action's primary purpose is to protect and/or restore BENM objects and values.

## **Vegetation**

### **Goals and Objectives**

- With the BEC and Tribes of the BEC, Agencies will identify the desired composition and range of conditions for vegetation communities throughout the BENM, including what communities are most appropriate for different areas, where Traditional harvest can be used as part of the management of the monument, and where fire can return natural vegetative communities. In planning for vegetation communities, consideration should be given to the importance of landscape patterns for vegetation.

- Manage vegetation and native plant communities to optimize plant community health and resilience to landscape-wide impacts.
- Manage vegetation to support fish and wildlife habitat and healthy watersheds.
- Manage vegetation to support traditional uses, medicinal plants and other vegetative resources identified by the BEC and Tribal Nations of the BEC as being culturally important according to Tribal expertise.
- Manage applicable vegetative types for multiple successional stages to provide for a high level of vegetative diversity and productivity.

### **Management Actions Common to All Action Alternatives**

- Agencies would collaborate with the BEC in identifying treatment priorities with the goal of improving vegetation conditions to minimize uncharacteristic fire risk.
- Coordinate with the BEC to incorporate Traditional Indigenous Knowledge in the identification and management of culturally important plants, where appropriate. Culturally important plants will be managed to protect them from potential impacts from uncharacteristic fire, livestock grazing, recreation, and other disruptive, discretionary management actions.
- Coordinate with the BEC to incorporate Traditional Indigenous Knowledge into vegetation management, including culturally appropriate management techniques and seasons.
- Agencies would coordinate with the Tribal Nations and the BEC in controlling the spread of invasive and non-native plants, especially cheatgrass, tamarisk, and Russian olive. Use a combination of Traditional Indigenous Knowledge and agency techniques to manage for a dense understory of native species with a reduction in tamarisk and improvement of cottonwood and willow regeneration.
- Together with the BEC, the Agencies would protect and/or enhance culturally important plant populations during fuels reduction activities.
- **ADDITIONAL TO AGENCY:** The Agencies and the BEC will work together to identify the importance of seasonality for vegetation management and treatments, harvest, and protection.

### **Management Actions by Alternative**

<b>Alternative E</b>
Row- 254 Different from alternative B.

Vegetation management throughout the BENM would prioritize traditional Indigenous Knowledge and Techniques for vegetation management and/or natural processes and techniques, with consideration of impacts on species using vegetation areas for habitat. Use of mechanical methods for vegetation management would be used only when absolutely necessary to provide for the care and management of BENM objects and values.

Only native, non GMO seeds would be used for revegetation/reclamation.

Mechanical methods would never include chaining.

Row 255- Similar to alternative B

Hazardous fuels reduction treatments would be used to restore ecosystems; protect human, natural, and cultural resources; and reduce the threat of wildfire to communities (2020 MMP) In addition to protecting human, natural, and cultural resources, fire and fuels treatments used throughout the BENM would be implemented with the goal of returning to natural fire return interval, historic vegetation condition, and landscape character, wherever possible and consistent with management of BENM objects and values, and where there is a low-risk of unintentional fire spread. Prohibit vegetation treatments and nonstructural range improvements whose primary purpose is to increase forage for livestock.

Row 256- Similar to alternative D

Agencies would coordinate with the Tribal Nations and the BEC to identify areas of high value/high risk and prioritize treatment in those areas that considers the importance of seasonality. These could include, but are not limited to, areas that provide traditional use plants or animals, areas not meeting desired Vegetation Condition Class (as defined in collaboration with the BEC), or areas that have significant cultural resources. Traditional Indigenous Knowledge would be prioritized in guiding vegetation management and cultural surveys would be included prior to vegetation management. Agencies and the BEC would prioritize the use of treatments using traditional Indigenous techniques and/or natural processes for vegetation management. Mechanical treatments other than chaining, would be used only when necessary to preserve, restore, and protect BENM objects and values.

Row 257- Similar to alternative B with the exception of the inclusion of other invasives

Whole tree extraction would be used in perennial water bodies for removal of invasives or noxious weeds such as Russian olive and tamarisk or any other invasive that threatens water supply and native species.

Row 258- Similar to alternative B with the exception of culturally important species and non-GMO seeds.

Agencies would collaborate with the BEC in determining appropriate seed mixes to provide for the revegetation of native and/or culturally important or traditionally harvested species. Priority will be on the use of native seeds for restoration based on availability, adaptation, and probability of success. Where probability of success or adapted seed availability is low, agencies would collaborate with the BEC to identify desirable nonnative, non GMO seeds that may be used in limited situations to protect, restore and/or increase resiliency of BENM objects and values.

Row 260- Similar to alternative A , except second sentence

Livestock grazing operations, pack stock, and riding stock users on the BENM would be required to use certified weed-seed-free feed (2020 MMP). Where possible precautions would be taken to limit weed seed transfer on hooves, boots, boats, wheel axles, and vehicles.

Row 261- Same as alternative A

Restoration and rehabilitation activities would be required to use certified weed-seed-free seed mixes, mulch, fill, etc. (2020 MMP).

Row 262- Same as alternative A

The power washing of equipment used for permitted or administrative uses would be required in areas with known weed populations or vectors to known weed populations to help control noxious weeds (2020 MMP).

Row 263- Similar to Alternative B

The agencies would collaborate with Tribal Nations and the BEC to provide for the monitoring, management, protection, and access to vegetation types important to Indigenous ceremonial or other traditional uses, with identification of culturally important plants where appropriate.

Agencies would collaborate with Tribal Nations and BEC on the identification of areas for seasonal closure to vegetation management and vegetation gathering as applicable to provide for resource rest or to allow for traditional uses or ceremonies.

Row 265- Different from agency matrix

Coordinate with BEC on management of and cultural appropriateness of seed collection, including collection for traditional, medicinal, and/or ceremonial uses, scientific collection, and BLM's Seeds of Success management program.

Row 266- Same as alternative B

The Agencies would collaborate with the BEC to identify areas in the BENM that would be closed to seed gathering as necessary to provide for sustainable annual seed production of native plants. An exception to this would be made to allow for private seed gathering and plant collection for Tribal Nations' traditional, medicinal, and ceremonial purposes.

Row 267- Different from agency matrix

Agencies would collaborate with the BEC, Tribal Nations, and the Counties in controlling invasive and non-native weed species, and the infestation and spread of new invasive species. This would include development of cooperative agreements and implementation protocols following the principles of the agencies' and Tribal Nations' weed management policies and action plans.

Row 268- Different from agency matrix

Any herbicide use or other control method (i.e. introduced species) would need to be approved by the BEC with consideration for unintended impacts of herbicide use and species introduced as a control measure on riparian areas, native vegetation, and wildlife.

Row 271- Similar to alternative B except with inclusion of BEC

In collaboration with the BEC, maintain existing vegetation treatments and design new vegetation treatments to preserve, restore, and protect BENM objects and values.

ADDITIONAL TO AGENCY MATRIX: Coordinate with the Tribal Nations and BEC to identify, where appropriate, traditionally harvested plants and their uses according to Traditional Indigenous Knowledge and Tribal expertise, monitor populations and locations of these species, and impacts of vegetation management on co-occurring vegetation and wildlife species. Coordinate with Tribal Nations and BEC on vegetation management, including management of plants used for traditional uses/ceremonies, invasive species control, and fuels management. Traditional Indigenous Knowledge will guide management of plants for traditional uses/ceremonies.

All seed and plant collection would be managed either through notification of use through a point of contact or a permitting system. Permitting process, stipulations, and regulations would be designed in coordination with the BEC and Tribal Nations.

ADDITIONAL TO AGENCY MATRIX Agencies would collaborate with the Tribal Nations and the BEC to co-identify measures to implement during drought. These could include but are not limited to:

- Limitations on seed collection.
- Limitations on camping and campfires.
- Limitations on livestock use and grazing.
- Additional requirements for restoration and/or erosion control.
- Changes in vegetation management, including limitations on prescribed burning.
- Limitations on surface disturbing activities.
- Closure of areas to public entry.

## **Forest and Woodlands**

### **Goals and Objectives**

- Agencies will collaborate with the BEC and consult with Tribal Nations to incorporate Traditional Indigenous Knowledge to maintain and/or promote continued health, diversity, and resiliency of forest structural stages, especially old growth.

### **Management Actions Common to All Action Alternatives**

- Agencies will coordinate with Tribal Nations and the BEC to incorporate Traditional Indigenous Knowledge to establish and implement forest health and forest management standards, assess conditions, and guide management decisions for woodland resources.
- When initiating vegetative management treatments in forested cover types, provide for a full range of seral stages by forested cover type that achieves a mosaic of habitat conditions and diversity. Each seral stage should contain a strong representation of early seral tree species.
- Collaborate with the BEC to identify opportunities for woodland harvests consistent with the BENM objects and values.
- Aspen is to be managed, with noncommercial treatments , with the goal of maintaining or increasing the aspen forest type.
- Agencies and the BEC will identify stands with old-growth characteristics and management practices to achieve old-growth management where applicable. An inventory and plan for managing stands with old-growth characteristics will be prepared

in collaboration with the BEC and Tribal Nations.

- The BEC and agencies will collaborate to follow forest health and forest management standards, policies, and guidelines based on Traditional Indigenous Knowledge and the best available peer-reviewed Western scientific inquiry to assess conditions, guide management decisions for woodland resources, and preserve the benefits to carbon sequestration and air quality from healthy forests.
- Where possible, Agencies would prioritize making fuelwood and forestry products resulting from fuels and vegetation projects readily available to the Tribal Nations and the public. All woodland harvest would require a personal use or ceremonial free-use permit. To facilitate permitting, the Agencies will establish a Firewood Advisory Committee, which shall consist of one representative from each of the Coalition Tribes, one representative from the U.S. Forest Service, and one representative from the BLM. The Advisory Committee shall create a framework for permitting traditional wood cutting and wood harvesting in the BENM according to Traditional Ecological Knowledge of the Tribal Nations of the BEC within 2 years of the publication of the ROD for this RMP.
- All lands in the BENM would be designated as lands not suited for timber production (i.e., growing, harvesting, and regenerating crops of trees for commercial use), however, timber management could be used as appropriate to provide for the preservation, restoration, and protection of BENM objects and values.
- Permits for private use of woodland products would continue to be issued to the public, consistent with the availability of woodland products and the protection of other resource values. Agencies would collaborate with the Tribal Nations and the BEC to identify appropriate areas for woodland harvest and to provide fuelwood for members of the Tribal Nations, including coordinating with Nations and other cooperating organizations to deliver wood products to farther communities. This collaboration would also include identifying areas for seasonal or multi-year closures to allow regeneration of woodlands or to provide for traditional or ceremonial uses as appropriate.

## Management Actions by Alternative

Alternative E
Row 310- Similar to Alternative B with the exception of de-emphasis of commercial timber production  Agencies would collaborate with the BEC to identify criteria and/or areas for both commercial timber production and commercial timber harvest only if these activities protect, restore and/or increase resiliency of BENM objects and values. This would include identifying opportunities to use forestry/woodland harvest to improve or restore healthy forest conditions. Emphasis would be placed on not providing for commercial timber production and harvest on BENM unless deemed necessary by the BEC and Tribal Nations of the BEC.
Row 311- Similar to alternative A with inclusion of cultural resource protection and where

**Alternative E**

removal of Pinyon pine is deemed necessary by collaborative body

Within woodland harvest areas collaboratively designated with the BEC and Tribal Nations, private use woodland harvest on BLM-administered and FS lands would be allowed with a permit in areas with pinyon pine and juniper encroachment and where site-specific analysis indicates that harvest would be useful for restoration of the diversified vegetative community, for protection of the sagebrush ecosystem, where negative effects to co-occurring species can be minimized, cultural resources can be avoided in the harvest, and the removal of Pinyon pine and Juniper is deemed necessary in collaboration with the BEC.

Row 312- Similar to alternative A with inclusion of BEC

Provide for woodland harvest to support fuel treatment projects, as needed and approved in collaboration with the BEC.

Row 313- Similar to alternative B

Agencies would collaborate with the Tribal Nations and the BEC to identify specific areas within the BENM that would be open or closed to woodland product use permanently or on a seasonal or multi-year basis to allow for resource rest. Limited on-site collection of dead wood for campfires would be allowed in WSAs, IRAs and Wilderness areas.

Row 315- Similar to alternative A

Exclude woodland product harvest from all developed recreation sites, livestock/wildlife exclosures, and cultural sites.

Row 316- Same as alternative B

Exclude floodplains, riparian and aquatic areas, and springs from woodland product use except for Tribal traditional and/or ceremonial uses. Agencies would collaborate with culturally affiliated Tribal Nations and the BEC on identification of those uses.

Row 317- Different from agency matrix

Unauthorized off-road motorized travel for wood gathering would not be allowed on the BENM. BLM, USFS, and the BEC would collaborate to limit or ban OHV access for wood gathering on designated routes or may grant OHV travel off designated routes if consistent with protecting the objects and values of the BENM. This determination would be made based on

**Alternative E**

monitoring of existing vegetation cover and soils erosion at the site-specific level and following the recommendations and guidance of the Firewood Advisory Committee. Exceptions would be granted for wood-gathering for ceremonial use.

Row 319- Similar to Alternative B with the exception of monitoring for establishing baselines

Where monitoring of vegetation cover and soil erosion indicates that woodland harvest is having potentially irretrievable or irreversible impacts on natural or cultural resources or is conflicting with BENM objects and values, the Agencies would collaborate with the BEC and the Firewood Advisory Committee to alter the designated woodland harvest area or harvest season as necessary to allow for resource rest or reclamation and/or to protect that resource or resource use. Consistent monitoring for soil erosion and vegetation cover will be needed to establish baselines.

Row 321- Similar to Alternative B with the exception of complete prohibition of clear cutting and co-design of standards

US Forest Service and the BLM would collaborate with the BEC in the selection and application of all silvicultural treatments. These would be evaluated on a case-by-case basis by agency forester/silviculturist and BEC Tribal forestry or Knowledge Holder representation to ensure prescribed activities incorporate Traditional Indigenous Knowledge and are consistent with desired cultural landscape value(s) for a given area.

Within 5 years of plan approval, identify and map forest stands with old growth forest characteristics or those developing old growth characteristics.

Promote continued and accelerated development of late-successional and old-growth habitat by treating early to mid-seral stage forest stands that have the potential to become late-successional and old-growth habitat.

If soil map units indicate treatment areas contain erosive soils, consider restricting logging or wood product removal requirements to assure controlling soil erosion within acceptable levels. Acceptable logging systems and methods will be evaluated on a site-by-site basis with agency hydrologist, silviculturist, and BEC.

Clearcutting on the Monument would be prohibited.

Forestry management activities would be designed to blend with the natural landscape.

Limits on maximum size opening created by silvicultural treatments would be co-decided by the BEC and the agencies.

Agencies would allow conventional logging equipment only on slopes less than 30% to avoid detrimental soil impacts.

Salvage of dead and/or dying trees would be done only when approved by the BEC and the salvage will move the stand towards a more ecologically resilient condition to protect, preserve,

<p><b>Alternative E</b></p> <p>and restore BENM objects and values.</p>
<p>Row 323- Similar to Alternative A except for the co-design of standards</p> <p>When initiating vegetative management treatments in forested cover types, minimum snag numbers and size standards should be co-designed by the Agencies and the BEC, with consideration for the cultural and ecological importance of snags.</p>
<p>Row 324- Similar to Alternative A except for the co-design of standards</p> <p>When initiating vegetative management treatments, minimum down log numbers and size standards should be co-designed by the Agencies and the BEC.</p>
<p>Row 325- Similar to Alternative A except for the inclusion of the BEC</p> <p>Prevent or suppress epidemic insect and disease populations that threaten forest and/or range land with an Integrated Pest Management (IPM) approach, developed in collaboration with the BEC, consistent with resource management objectives and protection of BENM objects and values.</p>
<p>Row 326- Similar to Alternative B with inclusion of regional patterns</p> <p>Agencies would collaborate with Tribal Nations, the BEC, the Intermountain Forest, and Rocky Mountain Research Station to plan and execute research where consistent with protecting, restoring, and /or increasing resiliency of BENM objects and values. This includes protecting surface resource conditions to prevent alteration of research projects. Research, monitoring, and management would integrate with regional and global studies to include the regional health of populations and account for potential impacts of climate change range shifts.</p>
<p>ADDITIONAL TO AGENCY MATRIX: Coordinate with the Tribal Nations and BEC to identify, where appropriate, traditionally harvested trees and their uses, monitor populations and locations of these species, and impacts of vegetation management on co-occurring vegetation and wildlife species. Coordinate with Tribal Nations and BEC on vegetation management, including management of plants used for traditional uses/ceremonies, invasive non-native species control, and fuels management. Traditional Indigenous Knowledge will guide management of plants for traditional uses/ceremonies.</p> <p>All seed and plant collection would be managed either through notification of use through a point of contact or a permitting system. Permit processes, regulations, and stipulations would be</p>

<b>Alternative E</b>
co-designed by the BEC.

## Lands with Wilderness Characteristics

### Goals and Objectives

- Collaborate with the BEC regarding proposed designations that preserve wilderness characteristics to ensure that the designation is guided by Traditional Ecological Knowledge and Tribal expertise.
- Protect, maintain, and preserve wilderness characteristics , considering consistency with this MMP and any implementation level planning, access for traditional, cultural and ceremonial practices for Tribal members, and in the context of competing resource demands.

### Management Actions by Alternative

Row 38-

All lands in the BENM that have been inventoried as having wilderness characteristics (approximately 447,412 acres) would be managed to conserve their wilderness characteristics while allowing for compatible uses (Figure X). Additional standards for wilderness characteristics and lands that meet these characteristics could be co-identified by the BEC and the Agencies. Management would include the following:

- OHV travel would be closed in these areas. There would be no additional routes designated within the 447,412 acres protected for their wilderness characteristics.
- Limitations on management actions and recreation use would be designed with consideration of seasonality in collaboration with the BEC.
- Lands would meet visual resource management standards as co-identified by the BEC and the Agencies.
- ROW (right of way) exclusion areas.
- Available for permitted private woodland harvest if beneficial or non-impairing to wilderness characteristics and if it would meet visual resource management class objectives.
- Available for vegetation, watershed, soil, or habitat improvements if beneficial or non-impairing to wilderness characteristics, and if it would meet visual resource management class objectives and conform to other management actions in this management plan.
- All existing facilities could be maintained at their current level but may be removed

at the discretion of the BEC and the Agencies.

- Fire suppression would be through light on the land or Minimum Impact Strategies and Techniques (MIST).
- Replacement of existing bolts and anchors would be allowed on existing routes only.

Different from Alternative A, different from Alternative B, different from Alternative C, different from Alternative D [All bullets are additional to the language in the agencies' matrix]

## **Terrestrial and Aquatic Species**

### **Goals and Objectives**

- Manage the BENM to protect large undisturbed blocks of wildlife habitat, and, where possible, consolidate and create larger protected blocks of habitat to ensure habitat connectivity.
- Maintain, enhance, and/or restore native aquatic, avian, and terrestrial and aquatic wildlife habitat quality and quantity, including seasonal, migratory, and connectivity habitats, in order to provide for biologically diverse and healthy ecosystems.
- Promote and restore healthy riparian habitat throughout the BENM by identifying the primary causes of negative impacts to riparian zones, removing invasive species, protecting riparian habitat from damage from livestock grazing, developing a monitoring and reporting program for riparian habitat and water quality that can contract with Tribal specialists and Knowledge Holders.
- Maintain and preserve aquatic connectivity through land acquisition and maintenance of instream flows and by removal of barriers where practicable.

### **Management Actions Common to All Action Alternatives**

- Agencies would coordinate with the Tribal Nations and the BEC in wildlife and wildlife habitat management. Agencies would collaborate with the BEC to manage to avoid adverse impacts on native aquatic, avian, and terrestrial species habitat, connectivity, and movement.
- During observed active nesting periods, conduct surveys for nesting native birds prior to implementation of projects. If nesting birds are observed, avoid discretionary actions that would impact these nesting birds. Fence construction or reconstruction, construction of roads, trails, and OHV routes will be sited and designed to avoid hazards and barriers to wildlife movement and connectivity.
- Vegetation management timing and activities will account for key life history requirements for resident and migratory birds, including identifying and minimizing

incidental take.

- Collaborate with the BEC and local, State, Federal, and Tribal partners designated by the BEC in program and project design to address management issues and minimize or avoid impacts to fish and wildlife species and their habitats across jurisdictional boundaries.
- Provide for habitat for viable populations of the existing vertebrate and invertebrate species found on BENM.
- Collaborate with the BEC, Tribal Nations of the BEC, and the State of Utah in management of habitats for species important to Tribal Nations and for species from the Utah State Wildlife Action Plan as amended/updated.
- Agencies will coordinate with the BEC and the State of Utah to incorporate Traditional Indigenous Knowledge to manage crucial wildlife habitat during key seasons. This could include closure of habitat areas to visitation or to certain uses (i.e., OHVs, commercial filming, etc.) on a seasonal basis to provide for resource rest, protect wildlife during key life history periods, or to allow for traditional/ceremonial use.
- Agencies would coordinate with the BEC to incorporate Traditional Indigenous Knowledge to determine seasonal restrictions on land-use authorizations affecting wildlife habitat.
- ADDITIONAL TO AGENCIES: Inventory and monitor fish and wildlife species and their habitats and coordinate with and contract Tribal biologists and Traditional Knowledge holders to contribute to a greater understanding of species abundance and distribution within the BENM. Monitoring would include youth whenever possible.
- ADDITIONAL TO AGENCY MATRIX: Agencies would collaborate with the BEC to identify and protect culturally and ecologically important wildlife (identified according to Traditional Ecological Knowledge and Tribal expertise) and their prey, cover, forage, habitat, and connectivity beyond special status species and species identified as game.
- ADDITIONAL TO AGENCIES: Management practices, procedures, and standards will be informed by an interweaving of Traditional Ecological Knowledge and the best available peer-reviewed western science.
- Trail cameras would be allowed on the BENM through permit only and when consistent with maintaining the privacy of traditional ceremonial uses. Use of trail cameras would be coordinated through BEC. Trail cameras should not be used for, or data shared for the purpose of trophy hunting.

## Management Actions by Alternative

<b>Alternative E</b>
Row 290- Different from agency matrix
Maintain, restore, and/or improve critical habitat requirements for native fish and amphibian

and aquatic species, including restoration and enhancement of backwater, side channel, and floodplain habitats, and monitoring of groundwater condition and water quality, and cumulative effects on watershed health. Manage habitat to minimize disturbance except when conducting riparian and aquatic habitat improvement projects. Conduct monitoring, restoration, and enhancement activities with Tribal Nations and the BEC, contracting with Tribal Professionals whenever possible.

Row 291- Different from agency matrix

Only allow recreational water pumping and purification from existing surface water bodies and springs (with exceptions for traditional use) in the BENM as co-decided by the BEC. Prohibit recreational water pumping and purification when drought conditions are severe, extreme, or exceptional.

Row 292- Similar to Alternative D with exceptions for Tribal use and regulation of bathing products.

Prohibit bathing in-canyon stream/pool habitat in BENM with exception for Tribal ceremonial use with restrictions on the use of non-environmentally friendly bathing products.

Row 293- Different from agency matrix

Allow the maintenance of existing precipitation catchments but not allow the installation of new precipitation catchments unless absolutely necessary to protect, restore and/or increase resiliency of BENM objects and values, (i.e., in places heavily accessed by culturally and ecologically important wildlife). The creation of precipitation catchments solely or primarily for livestock use would not be allowed and livestock access to precipitation catchments should be restricted.

Row 295- Different from agency matrix

Maintain or provide habitat for culturally and ecologically important species, including monitoring of forage, prey species, hiding cover, migration routes and connectivity. Manage crucial habitat for these species to minimize disturbance with the exception of habitat maintenance projects or vegetation treatments that are expected to benefit culturally and ecologically important species. Manage new or existing travel routes to protect habitat for culturally and ecologically important species. Prohibit new roads, trails, or other recreation development that might fragment or disturb nesting, fawning, calving habitat, winter range, or habitat necessary for other vulnerable life stages of culturally and ecologically important species.

Row 296- Similar to alternative B with exception of standards co-identified by the BEC and peer-reviewed science and TIK.

Provide habitat needs for Abert's squirrel in ponderosa pine habitat as validated by best peer reviewed science, Tribal policies, and Traditional Indigenous Knowledge.

Row 297- Similar to agency matrix except for the second sentence

Agencies and the BEC would work with stakeholder and volunteer groups to educate climbers on methods to protect significant natural and cultural resources. Agencies and the BEC would produce and provide educational information to reduce climbing and canyoneering impacts on active raptor nests.

Row 298-ADDITIONAL TO AGENCY MATRIX

During observed active nesting periods for raptors and migratory birds, (as identified by monitoring), proposed projects would be required to conduct surveys for nesting birds, if nesting birds are observed, avoid or minimize surface-disturbing activities and vegetation-altering projects, and broad-scale use of pesticides in identified and occupied migratory bird habitat. Agencies would collaborate with the BEC and Tribal Nations of the BEC to identify avoidance and mitigation requirements at the project specific implementation level.

Row 300- Similar to alternative A except for focus on BEC collaboration and continued monitoring

Bighorn Sheep

Five mesa tops within crucial bighorn sheep habitat referenced in Presidential Proclamation 10285 have previously been identified as areas of potential conflict between bighorn and activities that cause surface disturbance resulting in permanent loss of bighorn sheep habitat. Bighorn sheep habitat improvement projects will be prioritized in these areas. Continued monitoring of Bighorn sheep priority habitat, connectivity corridors, population size, health, long-term viability, and conflicts with surface disturbing activities will proceed in collaboration with the BEC and Tribal and Agency Programs. Continued monitoring of the five mesa tops and other existing and potential Bighorn Sheep habitat sites will be conducted in coordination with the BEC.

Livestock grazing and associated range improvement projects are not allowed on the previously identified five mesa tops and will not be allowed in any habitat priority areas or connectivity corridors for Bighorn sheep identified by future monitoring. (See Livestock Grazing)

Any future proposal for a change in kind of livestock from cattle to sheep in crucial desert bighorn sheep habitat will be denied in order to prevent competition for forage and the transmission of disease from domestic to wild sheep.(See Livestock Grazing)

Adhere to the recommendations in the BLM Bighorn Sheep Rangeland Management Plan (BLM 1993c, as revised); and the Utah BLM Statewide Desert Bighorn Sheep Management Plan, 1996 (as revised), and Tribal Policies regarding Bighorn sheep stewardship where practicable.

Row 301- Similar to alternative B except for further monitoring requirements of translocations

Agencies will coordinate with Tribal Nations, the BEC and UDWR in the introduction, translocation, augmentation, and re-establishment of both native and naturalized species to include but not be limited to pronghorn, desert bighorn sheep, wild turkey, beaver, chukar, Colorado River cutthroat trout, Endangered Colorado River fish species. Priority will be given to species that provide for traditional uses and ceremonies. Introduction, translocation, or re-establishment programs will require prior genetic and disease monitoring.

Row 302- Similar to Alternative B with exception of inclusion of modifications for increased connectivity and allowance for traditional hunt

Agencies will coordinate with Tribal Nations and the BEC to determine fence locations and establish fence standards, adapt trails, roads, and OHV routes (i.e. consider wildlife underpass and overpass infrastructure) to allow wildlife movement within existing or potential movement corridors. Traditional Indigenous Knowledge would be used in conjunction with agency data and standards to inform this process.

Ground-disturbing and permitted activities carried out in wildlife protection areas will be subject to special conditions regulating use, especially during certain seasons. Agencies will coordinate with Tribal Nations and the BEC to incorporate Traditional Indigenous Knowledge to develop any closures or seasonal restrictions. Any restrictions would still allow for traditional hunts.

Row 304- Similar to Alternative B except for time period allowance for life history changes due to climate change

#### Bighorn Sheep Lambing and Rutting Areas

Adhere to special conditions as developed in collaboration with the BEC and Tribal Nations from April 1 to June 15 for lambing, and from October 15 to December 15 for rutting or when lambing and rutting are observed.

Row 305- Similar to Alternative B except for time period allowance for life history changes due to climate change

<p>Deer Winter Range</p> <p>Adhere to special conditions as developed in collaboration with the BEC and Tribal Nations on 383,098 acres from November 15 to April 15 or where deer wintering behavior is observed.</p>
<p>Row 306- Similar to Alternative B except for time period allowance for life history changes due to climate change</p>
<p>Elk Winter Range</p> <p>FWL-34</p> <p>Adhere to special conditions as developed in collaboration with the BEC and Tribal Nations on 97,471 acres (Map 14) from November 15 to April 15 or when elk wintering behavior is observed.</p>
<p>ADDITIONAL TO AGENCY MATRIX: Discretionary actions including ground-disturbing actions that adversely impact fish and wildlife species and habitats would be avoided whenever possible. Where unavoidable disturbances are required, the BLM, US Forest Service, and BEC would collaborate on the application of appropriate minimization and mitigation measures following Federal and Tribal policies.</p>

## Special Status Species

### Goals and Objectives

- Protect special status species, including culturally identified species and their habitat to maintain and improve viable species populations.
- Ensure management actions support the protection of special status species and their habitats, including connectivity and movement needs, prey species, and forage.
- Avoid adverse impacts to special status species habitat, connectivity, movement, and prey species or forage. Where adverse effects cannot be avoided, ensure no net loss of special status species habitat, prey species, forage, connectivity, and movement.
- Collaborate with the BEC to identify special status species of cultural priority to each Tribe of the BEC; develop a plan for protecting these species using Traditional Ecological Knowledge and Tribal expertise.

### Management Actions Common to All Action Alternatives

- Manage habitat for species conservation to incorporate Tribal, State, regional, national, and global conservation strategies.
- Collaborate with BEC to maintain, protect, and enhance habitats (including but not limited to designated critical habitat) of federally listed Threatened, Endangered, or Candidate plant or animal species to actively promote recovery to the point that they no

longer need protection or prevent the listing of species under the ESA.

- Collaborate with the BEC to maintain, protect, and enhance habitats of the BLM State Director's sensitive species list, USDA Forest Service sensitive species list, species of conservation concern, and species of cultural importance to culturally-affiliated Tribal Nations (as determined through collaboration with the BEC) to ensure that actions requiring authorization or approval by the Agencies are consistent with the conservation needs of these species and do not contribute to the need to list any of these species under provisions of the ESA or becoming more vulnerable. Develop a strategy to ensure compliance with management prescriptions for listed species.
- Preserve, restore, and protect habitat connectivity and unrestricted special status species movement between ecological zones, seasonal use areas, and other areas important for sustainable populations. Allow construction of aquatic organism barriers if the benefit of non-native species control and special status species protection is greater than the loss in connectivity.
- Preserve, restore, and protect native habitat through vegetation management or other actions to support sustainable populations of special status species. Habitat treatments would be coordinated with the BEC and Agency resource programs to ensure consistency with preserving, restoring, and protecting BENM objects and values.
- Traditional use gathering of sensitive species plants would be managed either through notification of use through a point of contact or a permitting system designed in collaboration with the BEC. If a permitting system is used, Tribal members will be free to gather small quantities of sensitive species for cultural use pursuant to the permit stipulations. Tribes of the BEC will develop training programs to educate BENM users from Tribal communities about the proper uses of sensitive species.
- ADDITIONAL TO AGENCY: The effects of seasonality would be considered for limits on management and discretionary actions that might negatively impact special status species and their habitats and for management actions and treatments to protect these species and habitats.
- ADDITIONAL TO AGENCY: Impacts to special status populations, habitat, connectivity, forage, or prey base from recreation, livestock grazing, or any other discretionary use would be mitigated through closures.

### **Management Actions by Alternative:**

<b>Alternative E</b>
Row 212- Similar to alternative B with inclusion of Tribal standards
Agencies would collaborate with the BEC in the development of seasonal restrictions,

closures, and spatial buffers for raptor nesting and foraging habitat. At a minimum the restrictions and spatial buffers would comply with Utah Field Office Guidelines for Raptor Protection from Human and Land Use Disturbance (Romin and Muck 2002), ESA species recovery plans, and Tribal standards for raptor nesting and habitat protection.

Row 213- Similar to alternative A with inclusion of BEC

Agencies, in collaboration with the BEC, would post or otherwise provide educational information to reduce climbing and canyoneering impacts on active raptor nests.

Row 214- Similar to alternative B with exception for inclusion of nesting behavior

Coordinate with the Tribal Nations and the BEC to close active raptor nesting areas to visitation as necessary to provide for nesting success. This would include, if necessary, the closure of any OHV route access to nesting areas, as well as the closure of trails and climbing routes where active nests are located or nesting behavior is observed.

Row 215- Similar to alternative B with addition of closure of cave and cavern access

Agencies would collaborate with the BEC to seasonally restrict activities that impact bat roosting, hibernating, and breeding habitat, to include closing cave and cavern access to prevent disturbance and disease transmission.

Row 216- Same as alternative B

Agencies would collaborate with the BEC to require bat-friendly designs for all new construction (e.g., no obstacles across the top of water sources, etc.).

Row 217- Similar to alternative B with the exceptions of impacts being co-defined by the BEC, inclusion of wood harvesting, and increased limitations on camping.

Education and interpretation would be used to inform visitors of appropriate behaviors to minimize impacts to nesting Mexican spotted owl (MSO). No recreational use, especially overnight use, would be allowed to use MSO nesting areas from March 1 to August 31 or when nesting behavior is observed.

There would be no camping in MSO nesting areas. Wood harvesting would be prohibited in MSO nesting areas and within 100 feet of designated MSO habitat.

If adverse impacts, as co-defined by the BEC and the Agencies, are occurring to MSO occupied habitat:

- Group size limits may be implemented.
- Camping may be closed.
- Permits may be required to access affected areas.

Row 218- Similar to alternative D

No discretionary activities would be allowed in goshawk nesting habitat, habitat, connectivity and migration paths unless the action's principal purpose is to preserve, restore, and protect BENM objects and values according to the traditional ecological and indigenous knowledge of the BEC Tribes. Surveys of goshawk nesting and habitat needs would be completed during the cultural resources implementation planning phase.

Row 219- Same as alternative D

Discretionary actions would not be allowed where it would result in the loss of suitable goshawk habitat, prey base, and/or migration corridors.

Row 220- Similar to alternative D with the exception of the inclusion of connectivity

Maintain, restore, and/or improve special status aquatic species habitat and connectivity, including restoration and enhancement of backwater, side channel, and floodplain habitats. Manage habitat to ensure no net loss of habitat, except for short-term impacts during riparian and aquatic habitat projects that would procure a long-term benefit for those aquatic species.

Row 221- Same as alternative B

Agencies would collaborate with the BEC and USFWS in applying special species conservation measures for all activities to comply with the ESA, and the BLM Manual 6840, Special Status Species Management.

Row 222- Similar to alternative B with the exception of inclusion of culturally important species

Agencies would collaborate with the BEC in the development of pre-activity monitoring requirements for special status plants and animal species and endemic plant and animal species for traditional and ceremonial use. Projects with the potential to impact these species would be designed to avoid impacts to these species and/or achieve a no net loss of the species, their habitats, connectivity, and forage and/or prey species.

<p>Row 224- Same as alternative B</p> <p>No management action would be permitted that would jeopardize the continued existence of species that are listed, proposed for listing, or candidates for listing under the ESA.</p>
<p>Row 226- Similar to alternative B with the inclusion of the BEC</p> <p>When a party to a sensitive species' conservation agreement, the Agencies and the BEC would implement the agreement's provisions, including the Colorado River Cutthroat Trout Conservation Agreement and Strategy and Conservation Agreement for the roundtail chub, bluehead sucker, and flannelmouth sucker.</p>
<p>Row 230- Similar to alternative B with the exception of needs for increased monitoring</p> <p>Special status species native to the BENM would be allowed to be translocated to aid in conservation and recovery efforts only when culturally appropriate and if appropriate genetic and disease monitoring has been conducted prior to translocation. Necessary habitat manipulations and monitoring would be implemented to ensure successful translocation efforts.</p>
<p>Row 232- Similar to alternative B with the exception of inclusion of habitat, connectivity, and forage considerations</p> <p>Site-specific inventory would be conducted to determine presence or absence of prairie-dog colonies within potential/occupied habitat. Projects with the potential to impact colonies would be designed to avoid impacts and/or achieve a no net loss of the species, their habitats, connectivity, forage, and predators that rely on prairie dogs.</p>

**Visual Resource Management, Night Skies, and Soundscapes**

**Goals and Objectives**

- Manage public lands and resources to protect the quality of the scenic (visual) values.
- Manage Monument lands as VRM I and II for BLM lands and Very High and High SIO for Forest Service lands with mandatory prescriptions to protect scenic values, especially for areas with high cultural and conservation values such as lands with wilderness characteristics, areas identified by the BEC, backcountry recreation areas, scenic byway and backway corridors, WSAs, and ACECs.
- Manage public lands to protect the quality of night skies and natural soundscapes, including those qualities identified by the BEC as being culturally significant.

- Emphasize viewsheds as part of the “sky” in the “earth-to-sky” epistemology of the Coalition Tribes. This will educate visitors to the Monument regarding the importance of celestial observations, lunar and solar cycles, and other Traditional Indigenous Knowledge associated with natural darkness, the night sky, and unimpeded natural views. In some cases, this may include views of cultural resources, or objects and values. (LMP, p. 32).
- Explicitly include management direction in the VRM portion of the MMP provisions to protect and improve night skies to ensure that only natural sources of light are visible to the human eye throughout the Monument.
- Protect viewsheds and visual resources in a manner consistent with Tribal values and the BEITC Plan.
- Manage public lands in a manner that will protect the quality of the scenic (visual) values of these lands for present and future generations.

### **Management Actions Common to All Action Alternatives**

- Manage BLM-administered lands using the Visual Resource Management (VRM) system according to VRM class objectives and manage visual resources on NFS lands to SIO classes that are determined first through consideration of existing scenic quality followed by consideration of other resource values and land use allocations. Collaborate with the BEC as these standards are established to ensure that the expertise of the Tribal Nations with respect to views, soundscapes, and dark night skies is incorporated into the planning documents and framework.
- Promote Best Management Practices and ecological principles for reclamation of landscapes, restoration of native vegetation, and rehabilitation of waterways and riparian areas to enhance natural and historical scenic values that have been significantly degraded.
- Manage visual resources, soundscapes and dark night skies using the expertise of the Tribal Nations, including Traditional Indigenous Knowledge as provided by the BEC and Tribal Nations.
- Manage the BENM to maintain and enhance ecologically sound, resilient, and visually appealing natural and cultural landscapes that sustain scenic and sonic character in ways that contribute to visitors’ sense of place and connection with Nature. For Tribal visitors, intact views, soundscapes, and dark night skies allow for opportunities to continue unique and sometimes centuries old cultural practices in the BENM.
- Prohibit commercial mineral extraction activity, clear-cutting of timber, and creating roads in formerly roadless areas to protect cultural integrity of viewsheds, soundscapes and dark night skies. (Tribal LMP, p. 23).
- The night sky in open spaces should be protected in order to preserve ancestral connections, such that cultural traditions of Tribal Nations can be continued into the future. Light and dust pollution are factors that affect the quality of the night sky. (Tribal LMP, p. 25). Protect viewsheds due to their importance to Tribes as more than “scenery” in the sense of a view from a road or overlook (Tribal LMP, p. 26).
- Agencies would collaborate with the BEC to develop a night skies management plan and soundscapes management plan to mitigate effects from BENM uses.

## Management Actions by Alternative -

<b>Alternative E</b>
<p>Row 272-</p> <p>Collaborate with BEC to survey existing impacts to night skies, soundscapes, and visual resources and identify those that damage or degrade culturally affiliated Tribes' cultural practices requiring darkness and natural viewsapes.</p> <p>Different from agency matrix.</p>
<p>Row 273-</p> <p>BLM would collaborate with the BEC and Tribal Nations of the BEC to identify VRM-1 areas for management and co-define requirements of VRM-1 areas when possible.</p> <p>Different from agency matrix.</p>
<p>Row 274-</p> <p>BLM would collaborate with the BEC and Tribal nations to identify VRM-2 areas for management and co-define requirements of VRM-2 areas when possible.</p> <p>Different from agency matrix</p>
<p>U.S. Forest Service would manage all Forest Service lands to Very High and High SIO and co-define requirements of Very High and High SIO when possible.</p> <p>Different from agency matrix.</p>
<p>Row 275-</p> <p><b>VRM-3</b></p> <p>No BLM managed lands on the BENM would be managed as VRM-3, with exceptions for necessary facilities and temporary research projects. Any new Monument buildings and infrastructure must be designed and built to blend into the landscape while retaining functionality, not on ridges or other places that are visible from a distance. The Agencies shall collaborate with the BEC during the design and construction phases of any projects to ensure that Tribal expertise regarding viewsapes, soundscapes, and dark night skies is used to manage this aspect of the BENM.</p> <p>Different from agency matrix.</p>
<p>Row 276-</p> <p><b>VRM-4</b></p> <p>No BLM managed lands in the BENM would be managed as VRM-4.</p>

## **Alternative E**

Same as Alternative B, same as Alternative C, same as Alternative D.

ADDITIONAL TO AGENCY MATRIX Use NPS guidance to develop dark night skies program for BENM, in collaboration with the BEC. This program will promote western and indigenous scientific leadership to advance understanding and stewardship of natural sounds and night skies; highly specialized technical assistance; and development of policy and guidance to facilitate internal capacity building. Capacity building might include assistance in collecting baseline data for ambient acoustic and night sky quality, identifying source specific impacts and engineered solutions to reduce, mitigate or prevent anthropogenic noise and excessive light in and around the BENM. The goal of this program is to meet or exceed the standards for accreditation as an International Dark-Sky Association (IDA) International Dark Sky Sanctuary.

ADDITIONAL TO AGENCY MATRIX Coordinate with the BEC about the interpretive value of different vantage points and viewsheds in the Monument.

ADDITIONAL TO AGENCY MATRIX Identify culturally important viewsheds in the Monument, after collaborating and coordinating with the BEC.

ADDITIONAL TO AGENCY MATRIX Create interpretive materials in coordination with the BEC that highlight Tribal connections to distant areas visible from vantage points within the Monument.

## **Air Quality**

### **Goals and Objectives**

- Protect and enhance air quality and air quality related values (e.g., visibility) by ensuring that all authorized uses on public lands comply with Federal, State, and local laws and regulations for protecting air quality. Where federal law allows, enhance air quality as an object and value of the BENM according to Tribal expertise and Traditional Ecological Knowledge (LMP, p. 26).
- Minimize fugitive dust within the BENM by enacting management as appropriate to protect soil resources and minimize erosion.
- Protect air quality as a culturally important value of the BENM cultural landscape, using Tribal Ecological Knowledge and tribal expertise of the BEC Tribal Nations. (Tribal LMP, p. 26)
- Protect and enhance air quality and air quality related values (e.g., visibility) to maintain Visual Resources and Dark Night Skies priorities and values identified in the Tribal Land

Management Plan

**Management Actions Common to All Action Alternatives**

- Manage emissions and discretionary actions in BENM to enhance air quality, maintain wilderness character for designated Wilderness, and to preserve, restore, and protect BENM objects and values.
- Manage emissions and discretionary actions in BENM to ensure compliance with state, federal, and permissible Tribal air quality standards.
- Collaborate with the BEC in identifying opportunities for climate change resiliency wherever practicable.
- Collaborate with Tribal Nations of the BEC, local and county governments, and surrounding communities to ensure that activities outside the Monument do not impair visibility and air quality within the Monument.
- Manage entire BENM as VRM Class I or Class II.

**Management Actions by Alternative**

<b>Alternative E</b>
Row 328-  In coordination with Utah Division of Air Quality (UDAQ), U.S. EPA, BEC, and Tribal Nations of the BEC, the Agencies would implement Best Available Control Technologies, emission controls, and site-specific mitigation measures, as appropriate, to reduce emissions and enhance air quality. This includes, but is not limited to, emissions of pollutants like methane.  Similar to Alternative B, similar to Alternative C, similar to Alternative D
Row 329-  Agencies would collaborate with the BEC, Tribal Nations, U.S. EPA, and the State of Utah Division of Environmental Quality (UDEQ) to time and implement prescribed burns in conjunction with meteorological conditions to minimize smoke impacts, particularly on sensitive receptors.  Same as Alternative B, same as Alternative C, same as Alternative D

Row 330

Agencies would comply with Utah Air Conservation (UAC) Regulation R307–205, which prohibits the use, maintenance, or construction of roadways without taking appropriate dust abatement measures.

Same as Alternative B, same as Alternative C, same as Alternative D

Row 331

The Agencies would comply with the Utah Smoke Management Plan, which requires reporting size, date of burn, fuel type, and estimated air emissions from each prescribed burn. Collaborate with the BEC and the Tribal Nations of the BEC to ensure that prescribed burns are conducted in a way that is culturally appropriate, including seasonal appropriateness.

Similar to Alternative A, similar to Alternative B, similar to Alternative C, similar to Alternative D (except collaboration with BEC and seasonal and cultural appropriateness of prescribed burns)

Row 332-

The Agencies would manage emissions to prevent adverse impact to air quality in Class I Airsheds.

Same as Alternative A, same as Alternative B, same as Alternative C, same as Alternative D

Row 333-

Agencies would collaborate with the BEC, Tribal Nations of the BEC, the National Park Service and other state and federal Agencies to develop air quality assessment protocols to address cumulative impacts to haze, dark skies, and other regional air quality issues. Collaborate with the BEC and the Tribal Nations of the BEC to ensure that air quality assessment protocols are conducted in a way that is culturally appropriate, including seasonal appropriateness, and consistent with the cultural resources implementation plan.

Same as Alternative B, same as Alternative C, same as Alternative D

Row 334-

Agencies would collaborate with the BEC, Tribal Nations and Utah Airshed Group to manage

emissions from wildland and prescribed fire activities.

Same as Alternative B, same as Alternative C, same as Alternative D

Row 335-

National Ambient Air Quality Standards are enforced by the Utah Department of Environmental Quality, Division of Air Quality (UDEQ-DAQ), with EPA oversight when federal baseline standards are not met. Special requirements to reduce potential air quality impacts would be considered on a case-by-case basis in processing land-use authorizations, and will be prioritized when visibility impacts cause areas to exceed criteria for VRM I or II.

Same as Alternative A, same as Alternative B, same as Alternative C, same as Alternative D

Row 337-

Project specific analyses would consider use of quantitative air quality analysis methods (e.g., emissions inventory or modeling), when the project has substantial emissions as determined by the Agencies, in coordination with the BEC, Tribal Nations of the BEC, state, and federal agencies.

Same as Alternative A, same as Alternative B, same as Alternative C, same as Alternative D

## **Built Environment**

### **Cultural Resources**

### **Goals and Objectives**

#### **TRIBAL COLLABORATION**

- Agencies should seek to enter into agreements to share capacity, expertise, and insight into fostering the collaborative stewardship of sacred sites and other properties of traditional, spiritual, and cultural importance with the BEC and the Tribal Nations of the BEC.
- Agencies should notify Tribal Nations of the BEC, including cultural leaders and knowledge holders of any survey work, including ethnographic and cultural survey work, so that Tribes can collaborate in the work and create opportunities for Tribal contractors to undertake the work. BEC collaboration will also allow for Tribes to engage Medicine people, cultural leaders, and other Traditional Indigenous Knowledge holders.

**Goal 1 - Manage cultural resources in collaboration with BEC and culturally-affiliated Tribal Nations of the BEC for present and future generations in ways consistent with their scientific, educational, recreational, and traditional Tribal Nations uses and traditional knowledge.**

**Objectives**

- Agencies should manage cultural resources in collaboration with the BEC and Tribal Nations of the BEC as required by Presidential Proclamation 9558, and amended by Proclamation 10285, for present and future generations in ways consistent with Tribal scientific, educational, cultural, and traditional Tribal uses.
- Agencies should engage the Bears Ears Commission (BEC) and work with Tribal Nations of the BEC to identify and evaluate properties of cultural significance, such as sacred sites, cultural landscapes, and traditional cultural properties (TCPs). Archaeological and other cultural surveys and inventories should be combined so as to minimize burdens on Tribal resources. These inventories should focus on and include areas of the BENM actively used by Tribes for cultural purposes.
- Agencies will provide funding and other resources to support Tribal cultural inventories, including inventories of plants, animals, birds, fish, of cultural importance and use to Tribes of the BEC. This includes plants, animals, birds, and fish that are medicine or used for subsistence purposes.
- Collaborate with the BEC and Tribal Nations of the BEC to identify and incorporate Traditional Indigenous Knowledge, where appropriate, about cultural landscapes, and traditionally significant plants and forest resources. This collaboration will be separate from the section 106 consultation process required by the National Historic Preservation Act.
- Collaborate with the BEC and Tribal Nations of the BEC, and other Tribal Nations, to facilitate educational opportunities within Tribal communities and within the BENM for youth groups, elders, or other similar groups, including collaboration on the development of facilities and venues.
- Provide and coordinate access for Tribal Nations of the BEC to use sacred sites or other sites within the BENM for ceremonies, gatherings, and other cultural activities as identified by Tribes.
- Manage cultural resources in collaboration with the BEC and Tribal Nations of the BEC as required by Presidential Proclamation 9558, and amended by Proclamation 10285, for present and future generations in ways consistent with Tribal scientific, educational, cultural, and traditional Tribal uses.
- Protect objects and values of the BENM using Traditional Indigenous Knowledge provided by designated Tribal subject-matter experts of the Tribal Nations of the BEC. Define “cultural resources” according to perspectives of the Tribal Nations of the BEC, which may include aspects of the built environment, in addition to plants, animals, fish, birds, minerals and landscapes or regions, to include the entire monument.

**Goal 2 - Minimize damage to cultural resources from visitor use. Agency approvals for projects to manage visitors should follow engagement with the BEC and incorporate the indigenous knowledge shared by the BEC.**

**Objectives**

- Collaborate with the BEC and Tribal Nations of the BEC to identify adverse impacts of visitation impacting cultural resources, including cultural sites and the cultural landscape, and address those impacts, including through educating recreational visitors about descendant community connections to BENM and cultural resources and etiquette to avoid or limit impacts to cultural resources.
- Collaborate with the BEC and Tribal Nations of the BEC on appropriate interpretation and education of the public about cultural resources and their connections to ancient, Indigenous descendant communities. This interpretation must incorporate and reflect, rather than diminish distinct Nations' connections to and knowledge of this sacred landscape. Provide opportunities for Indigenous guides to participate in interpretation and education.
- Collaborate with the BEC and Tribal Nations of the BEC to educate recreational visitors, including Special Recreation Permit holders and participants, about the cultural history of the Monument, descendant community connections to BENM and cultural resources, backcountry site visitor etiquette, and etiquette to avoid or limit impacts to cultural resources. This may include, but is not limited to, wildlife as a cultural resource of Tribes, proper use of trails, restricted and closed areas, justification for closures, wildlife migration trails and corridors, and Tribal expertise regarding seasonally appropriate uses.
- Identify an appropriate location for Tribal learning and learning spaces and places, (i.e., culturally important plants, such as corn and cultural gardens) to facilitate educational opportunities within Tribal communities with youth groups, elders, or other similar groups.

**Goal 3 - Provide Tribal Nations of the BEC with access to and use of traditional cultural properties, sacred sites, cultural landscapes, and traditionally significant vegetation, forest products, and minerals.**

**Objectives**

- Provide for use by culturally-affiliated Tribal Nations of TCPs, sacred sites, cultural landscapes, and traditionally significant vegetation and forest products.
- Manage BENM natural resources, such as water, wildlife, plants, trees, and other resources, to support cultural uses by culturally-affiliated Tribal Nations.
- Collaborate with the BEC and Tribal Nations of the BEC to facilitate educational opportunities within Tribal communities for youth groups, elders, or other similar groups, including collaboration on the development of facilities and venues. (See comments above)

- Facilitate Indigenous uses of sacred sites or other sites within the Monument for ceremonies and gatherings as identified by the BEC, the Tribal Nations of the BEC, and other culturally-affiliated Tribal Nations.
- Establish and implement protective measures in coordination with the BEC, the Tribal Nations of the BEC, and other culturally-affiliated Tribal Nations for sites, structures, objects, and traditional use areas in order to maintain the viewsheds and intrinsic values, as well as the auditory, visual, and aesthetic settings of the resources. Tribal Nations will determine what information is appropriate to share with agencies and the public and how to present that information so as to preserve the unique connections of each Tribe to the Monument.

**Goal 4 - Address data gaps and increase sharing and acquisition of data between Tribes of the BEC and land managers about culturally significant resources within the Monument.**

**Objectives**

- Develop a comprehensive data sharing agreement in which the BLM and USFS share data co-ownership with the Tribes of the BEC including, but not limited to: archaeological data, including a complete inventory of BENM; ethnographic research and TCP surveys; natural resources data on quality and conditions of water, plants, animals, birds, air; land use, and recreation data.
- Develop confidentiality agreements allowing the Tribes of the BEC to share sensitive cultural resource information, where appropriate, that can be used when considering or evaluating projects.
- Identify culturally significant landscapes to be protected when evaluating projects, permits and other permissions involved with management of the BENM.

**Goal 5 - Support an interdisciplinary Traditional Knowledge Institute within or near BENM under the collaborative management of the BEC and Tribal Nations with support from the BLM, and U.S. Forest Service.**

**Objectives:**

- Support the BEC and the Tribal Nations of the BEC in the creation of programs for the Traditional Knowledge Institute which may include but are not limited to a Natural Resources Program, a Cultural Ranger Program, and a Curriculum Development Program.

**Management Actions Common to all Alternatives**

- Agencies will manage cultural resources in collaboration with the BEC and the Tribal Nations of the BEC as required by Presidential Proclamation 9558, and amended by Proclamation 10285, for present and future generations in ways consistent with their scientific, educational, recreational, and traditional Tribal Nations' uses.
- Agencies will collaborate with the BEC to develop a comprehensive interpretive plan or plans for the planning area (See Cross-Cultural Education and Outreach section of this

matrix). The interpretive plan(s) would follow BLM and FS guidelines as well as defining the BLM's and FS's overall interpretation and education vision, goals, themes, strategies, and opportunities, and the BEC Tribal Nations' education vision, goals, themes, strategies, and opportunities. The plan would include a long-range implementation strategy that includes partnership development, staffing needs, and program costs.

- Agencies will work collaboratively with the BEC and Tribal Nations of the BEC, to stabilize ancestral sites with standing architecture, where appropriate, to ensure the integration of some Tribal Nations' values that these sites complete their natural life cycles. Tribal Nations' values will primarily inform the methods used, but other considerations may include safety, and other archaeological and interpretive values. Architectural stabilization should only be considered for sites where it is required to protect site values as determined through collaboration with the BEC and Tribal Nations of the BEC, and in consultation with other culturally affiliated Tribal Nations through the Section 106 process or any other process allowed by federal law.
- During implementation level planning, agencies will collaborate with the BEC to develop and maintain a database with maps for fire-sensitive cultural resources (including wildlife and plants that are associated with important cultural practices) and make it available for the fire management and fuel reduction planning and for resource protection during fire management activities within three years of plan decision.
- Cultural resources, including archaeological sites, historic sites, cultural landscapes, districts, and traditional cultural properties that are managed according to the National Historic Preservation Act and its implementing regulations, as well as any applicable Tribal laws that inform Tribes' Section 106 consultation recommendations (clarify that this is part of the BEC's responsibility) and the BEC's recommendations, would be maintained and managed to preserve their National Register of Historic Places characteristics and integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, or association. The BEC will not undertake Section 106 consultation on behalf of any Tribe, but the agencies will collaborate with the BEC regarding any information gathered during the Section 106 consultation process.
- To ensure cultural resources including sacred sites, plant populations and communities, and sacred landscapes are managed appropriately, Agencies will collaborate with the BEC and Tribal Nations of the BEC to implement management actions to preserve or enhance their ecological condition, setting for solitude, privacy, quiet, and scenic character, and incorporating seasonal attributes to management actions that reflect important Tribal values around seasons, such as rest.
- To enhance cultural resource resilience to fire, wildfire protection activities and fuels management projects will implement TIK techniques and outcomes to benefit cultural resource preservation and resiliency. Preservation and resiliency will be defined using Tribally informed perspectives from each of the Tribal Nations of the BEC. Traditional Indigenous Knowledge regarding harvesting as a fire management technique should be incorporated as part of the fire resilience strategy.
- During implementation level planning, measures to protect cultural resources from

deterioration due to natural forces, visitation, or from agency authorized and unauthorized use will be developed collaboratively with BEC and Tribal Nations of the BEC.

- To protect cultural resources, the effects of natural disturbance, such as wildfire, erosion, and freeze-thaw cycles, that might be accelerated by climate change would be proactively managed by the Agencies, the BEC, and the Tribal Nations of the BEC.
- Agencies will collaborate with the BEC and Tribal Nations of the BEC so that the Tribal perspectives and Traditional Knowledge become integral components of BENM management actions and decisions.
- Agencies will collaborate with BEC and Tribal Nations of the BEC to educate Agency employees about cultural sensitivity protocols, Tribal legal rights, treaty obligations, Tribal sovereignty and governance protocols, and the unique government-to-government relationship between Tribal Nations and the United States federal government.
- Agencies will collaborate with the BEC to identify sites where recreational visitation may be causing an impact to the landscape or to cultural resources and mitigate those impacts, including educating recreational visitors about Indigenous connections to BENM, cultural resources and etiquette to avoid or limit impacts to cultural resources, and where necessary, controlling and/or limiting recreational visitation. When possible, agencies will involve youth and Tribal elders in these efforts.
- Agencies will provide opportunities for volunteers to partner with the agencies and the Tribal Nations of the BEC to identify, study, and monitor sites. This could include partnering with the forest heritage program, Tribal Nations and volunteer organizations.
- Agencies will collaborate with the BEC and Tribal Nations of the BEC to identify resource management projects or settings that provide educational opportunities for Tribal youth of the BEC Tribal Nations and other culturally affiliated Tribal Nations.
- Agencies will collaborate with the BEC and Tribal Nations of the BEC to identify cultural resources on the BENM that might only be recognized by those individuals who are cultural knowledge holders within the Tribal Nations of the BEC and develop management strategies to protect them, incorporating Traditional Indigenous Knowledge and Tribal expertise respective to these resources.
- Within 5 years of the public release of this MMP, Agencies will develop management strategies in collaboration with the BEC and the Tribal Nations of the BEC designed to protect, restore, and maintain culturally significant resources, such as hunting areas, plant gathering areas, wood, and cultural mineral traditional gathering locations and springs. This may require agencies to allow stewardship of certain plant resources, pursuant to Traditional Ecological Knowledge and traditional cultural practices of the Tribal Nations of the BEC.
- Agencies will meet quarterly with BEC and designated representatives of the Tribal Nations of the BEC to collaborate, partner, and ensure that important resources or places are available for Tribal use and are protected from authorized and unauthorized uses, unless Agencies and the BEC or Tribally designated staff or teams decide to meet more

frequently.

- Agencies will keep all sensitive cultural information confidential and safeguarded from public release to the extent allowed by law. This includes locations of cultural resource sites, traditional beliefs, Light Detection and Ranging or LiDAR data, and cultural and traditional activities.
- Agencies will collaborate with the BEC and Tribal Nations of the BEC to manage ethnographic or other sensitive cultural information. The BEC and/or Tribal Nations of the BEC will identify agency staff members who shall have access to that information. BEC and/or applicable Tribal Nations' approval would be required to release that information and it would be protected by agencies to the extent allowed under Federal law. Release of information would need to be approved by the BEC, or by designated cultural knowledge holders. Archaeological and cultural resource inventories would be required to consider the non-material (intangible) aspects of cultural sites in BENM. Knowledgeable Tribal members, designated by the BEC, must be included in archaeological identification and recording where possible. Agencies and the BEC will create a confidential ethnographic attachment that would remain internal to Tribes and append to all site forms. This attachment would document known TCPs in the study area and any ethnographic information that would be pertinent to the archaeological site.
- The Agencies will collaborate with BEC and Tribal Nations of the BEC early and frequently in implementation-level project planning to provide adequate time for input and approval by BEC and Tribal Nations of the BEC, including specific governmental protocols required by Tribal law. Collaborative management activities and meetings will respect important ceremonial times and seasons of the year and the ceremonial obligations of Tribal collaborators.
- To ensure BEC and Tribal Nations and their representatives can conduct ceremonial activities in private, the Agencies will collaborate with the BEC in identifying temporary or permanent area closures as needed.
- To ensure Tribal access to culturally valued BENM resources, Agencies and the BEC will manage use either through notification of use through a point of contact or a permitting system for collecting and gathering of BENM resources for cultural and traditional ceremonies and practices. If a permitting process is implemented, free Tribal and personal use permits for collecting and gathering traditional use materials would be administered collaboratively with BEC and Tribal Nations of the BEC.
- To identify ways to protect cultural resources from adverse impacts due to visitation or other proposed management actions, the Agencies will collaborate with the BEC and Tribal Nations of the BEC to develop and approve site-specific project design and management activities.
- **ADDITIONAL TO AGENCY:** The Agencies will work with Tribal Nations to create a comprehensive agreement to assist with efficient repatriation of Native American human remains and cultural items under the Native American Graves Protection and Repatriation Act (NAGPRA). This agreement should be guided by Traditional Indigenous Knowledge regarding the proper care of ancestral human remains, including

ancient human remains. It should reflect Tribal values; human ancestral remains should remain in place where found and should not be disinterred or disturbed. This may require agencies to establish barriers preventing the public from coming into contact with ancestral remains. Human remains, including paleoanthropological remains, discovered in the Monument should be evaluated on a case-by-case basis in collaboration with the BEC and the appropriate cultural advisors from each Tribe. Upon discovering ancestral human remains in the Monument, the appropriate Tribal Historic Preservation Offices and the BEC should be notified immediately.

- **ADDITIONAL TO AGENCY:** In collaboration with the Tribal Nations of the BEC, the Agencies will develop a plan for protection and/or repatriation of cultural objects currently under the care or custody of the BLM (including in the Cerberus Collection and other BLM-administered collections and including items confiscated by the agencies), and/or USFS, and the development of associated interpretive and educational materials (if the Tribal Nations of the BEC deem items in the collection appropriate for public display).

## Management Actions by Alternative

### Alternative E

Row 3-

Agencies will collaborate with the BEC and the Tribal Nations of the BEC and consult with other culturally-affiliated Tribal Nations to co- create a cultural resources management plan (CRMP), which will be developed after the completion of this MMP in coordination with the BEC and the Tribal Nations of the BEC, and completed within 2 years of the publication of this MMP in coordination with the BEC and Tribal Nations of the BEC and in consultation with other culturally-affiliated Tribal Nations. The CRMP will include site-specific, implementation-level direction to effectively manage uses while protecting the integrity of significant cultural resources. Tribal site visits should be planned as part of the development of the CRMP. Resources and places on the landscape will not be considered separately from the landscape as a whole. The development of this plan would not preclude the incorporation of Tribal values and perspectives in all sections of this MMP.

The CRMP would include the following:

- Management tools and methods that include, where appropriate, Tribal protocols for identifying and evaluating cultural resources in collaboration with the BEC and Tribal Nations of the BEC and BEC identified Tribal representatives, including TCPs, Tribal Nations' sacred sites, cultural landscapes, Traditional Indigenous Knowledge about cultural landscapes and traditionally significant plants, wildlife, minerals, and tree species. The agencies shall also engage other culturally-affiliated Tribal Nations, consistent with the requirements of the NHPA Section 106 consultation process, and

any other applicable federal laws, regulations, or agreements.

- A timeline for the completion of priority cultural and historic resource inventories in collaboration with the BEC and Tribal Nations of the BEC (developed within the first year of planning).
- Required intensive surveying annually, using western scientific and Indigenous methodologies, with the number of acres to be co-decided by the BEC and the Agencies.
- A monitoring and stabilization plan for cultural resource sites. In collaboration with the BEC, identify criteria and risk factors for sites that should be included in the plan, including but not limited to areas currently receiving visitation or that are impacted by visitation, grazing, climate change, vegetation management, and risks to springs that may compromise the integrity of a site. Mitigation measures include, but are not limited to: stabilization, protective measures (e.g., fences and/or surveillance equipment), grazing limits, exclosures, avoidance, protection of the water table, education, or interpretation.
- An interpretation plan that identifies types of sites meeting education goals as co-defined by the BEC, including suitability of sites allocated for specified uses.
- Requirements for coordination with the Tribal Nations of the BEC, the BEC, identified consulting parties, and recreational and volunteer groups to assist with monitoring, education, and interpretation. Agencies should emphasize groups that involve youth, native stewardship and incorporation of Tribal perspectives, Tribal monitoring, and centering of Tribal interpretive values.
- A Plan to develop and manage volunteer and cooperative agreements with third-party organizations to assist with the implementation of on-the-ground projects, monitoring, and other public education and outreach activities pertaining to cultural resources.
- Site-specific criteria for addressing SRP applications and other permits and federal permissions requesting visitation to cultural resource sites.
- Agencies should prohibit the collection of archaeological objects and other cultural resources and work with the BEC to establish a protocol for repatriating unlawfully collected or removed cultural resources.
- Access for Tribal members to continue non-commercial traditional use and harvest of vegetation, and for the collection of herbs, medicines, traditional use items, and items necessary for traditional, religious, or ceremonial purposes.
- A schedule created in collaboration with the Tribal Nations of the BEC to allow sites to rest. Resting periods may occur in specific seasons or years, and visitation should be restricted during these times. Collaborative management meetings and activities will respect ceremonial times of the year and respect rest for BEC and Tribal representatives.
- An earth-to-sky based framework, recognizing the interrelatedness of the entire cultural landscape of the BENM to the Tribes of the BEC.

- A collaborative strategic plan by the Tribes of the BEC, the BLM, and USFS to jointly pursue funding to conduct cultural resource inventories.
- The BLM and USFS will conduct Class III cultural resource inventories in a manner that complies with Tribal protocols, Section 110 of the National Historic Preservation Act and Section 14 of the Archaeological Resources Protection Act. Priorities for inventory include the following (in this order):
  - Group 1: Areas that receive heavy public use and/or those that lack intensive inventory in relation to current standards
  - Group 2: Areas that need records clarification or updating
  - Group 3: Areas with little or no previous inventory
  - Group 4: Areas with inventories more than 10 years old.

These inventory priorities may change in response to changing conditions; uses and input from Tribes, researchers, and educators; or other changed circumstances such as changes in travel management implementation guidelines (why changes in travel management implementation guidelines). Inventory and site documentation will adapt existing Tribal protocols and should involve/employ members of the Tribal Nations of the BEC.

similar to alternative B, similar to alternative C, similar to alternative D [except different from existing alternatives as far as detail provided on development of CRMP, parties involved, Classes of cultural resources inventories, and delineation between BEC Tribes and other Tribes.]

Row 4-

Protective measures would be established and implemented in coordination with the BEC, the Tribal Nations of the BEC, and other culturally-affiliated Tribal Nations for sites, structures, objects, and traditional use areas that are important to Tribal Nations with historical and cultural connections to the land to maintain the viewsheds and intrinsic values, as well as the auditory, visual, and aesthetic settings of the resources. Protection measures for undisturbed cultural resources and their natural settings would be developed in compliance with regulatory mandates and in collaboration with the BEC. Coordinate law enforcement efforts with the BEC and the Tribal Nations of the BEC to protect cultural sites and historic properties.

Similar to alternative A, similar to alternative B, similar to Alternative C, similar to Alternative D (except Alt E delineates between BEC Tribes and other tribes)

Row 5-

The agencies, in partnership with the BEC and Tribal Nations of the BEC, would proactively reduce hazardous fuels or mitigate the potential hazard around archaeological and cultural sites that are susceptible to destruction by fire from prescribed fires or wildfire. Management response to fire would follow guidelines described in the Fire management section and in

current implementation level fire management planning documents. Hazardous fuels mitigation and fire mitigation shall utilize traditional Tribal methods when feasible, and Tribal Nations of the BEC can provide assistance and additional capacity in this area through contracts/conservation corps/personal harvest of fuelwood.

Same as alternative B, same as Alternative C, same as Alternative D

Row 6-

Unauthorized Use of domestic pets and pack animals would not be allowed in cultural resource areas (including archaeological resources) except for historic roads and trails. Where problems occur, the agencies would evaluate posting signs to notify visitors of restrictions and explore protective measures like leash requirements.

Same as alternative B, same as Alternative C, same as Alternative D

Row 7-

Protective measures related to potential recreation impacts include the following:

- Camping of any kind would not be allowed within archaeological resources and other cultural resources.
- Campfires would not be allowed in archaeological sites, except campfires may be allowed in archaeological sites for culturally affiliated Tribes to accommodate Tribal Nation's traditional, medicinal, and ceremonial purposes and practices.
- Ropes and climbing aids would not be allowed to access archaeological resources and other cultural resources unless used for scientific purposes with a permit and as approved by the BEC, for administrative (Tribal and agency) access, or for emergencies.
- Prohibition on casual drone use throughout the Monument. Agencies shall collaborate with the BEC to determine areas and seasons when drone use may be permitted for Tribal use, administrative use, or emergencies. Cultural sites are considered to be open to visitation unless closed, except for kivas and Tribally designated structures. The interiors of any cultural sites would be considered closed. Cultural sites other than kivas and Tribally designated structures may also be closed to visitation when their condition is determined to be at risk (such as due to vandalism or other forms of harm or destruction) or when they contain visitor safety hazards. Agencies would work with the BEC to determine the best way to implement closures, and how to manage the potential impact of closing sites.
- Agencies would consult with the Tribal Nations and the BEC to identify seasons for closure for culturally significant areas as appropriate to allow for

resource rest and to provide for traditional and ceremonial uses.

Similar to Alternative D

Row 8-

The agencies will pursue funding to collaborate with the BEC to gather information on the importance of cultural resources to Tribal Nations of the BEC and other culturally affiliated Tribal Nations, including ethnographic work and traditional knowledge, culturally appropriate documentation, recognition of important traditional use areas, and culturally important plants. Agencies would also collaborate with the BEC on the prioritization of information gathering and the appropriateness of information sharing.

Similar to Alternative A, Similar to Alternative B, Similar to Alternative D, except that language regarding agencies pursuing funding is mandatory (which was contained in prior version of matrix).

Row 9-

In addition to the specific sites indicated below, Agencies would collaborate with the BEC to determine which cultural resources to allocate to uses at the implementation planning phase during the 2 years following the public release of this MMP and any other cultural resources will be allocated in the cultural resource management planning phase. Based on levels of use, type of site, and sensitivity of sites as determined in collaboration with the BEC and Tribal Nations, sites would be categorized as Developed Public Use, Undeveloped Public Use, Scientific Use, or Traditional Use, or Public Use (Undeveloped).

Same as Alternative B, same as Alternative C, same as Alternative D

Row 10-

The Agencies would allocate the following cultural sites as Public Use (Developed) because they are currently managed as Public Use sites and are currently subject to high visitation. The Agencies would collaborate with the BEC to develop management direction for these sites. The agencies would consult with the BEC, Tribal Nations, the BENM Advisory Committee, and the public, as appropriate, to add or remove sites to this list as necessary.

- Newspaper Rock
- Shay Canyon
- Butler Wash Developed Roadside
- Mule Canyon Kiva
- River House
- Butler Wash Panel
- Arch Canyon Great House complex

- House on Fire
- Moon House
- Doll House
- Hole-in-the-Rock Trail/
- San Juan Hill
- Butler Wash Dinosaur Track Site
- Lower Butler Wash Panel
- Salvation Knoll
- The following sites would be allocated for Public Use (Developed)
  - o Sites chosen in collaboration with the BEC.
- And the following site which would be allocated as Public Use Undeveloped:
  - o Sites chosen in collaboration with the BEC.

Similar to Alternative D, except some public use designations would be made in collaboration with the BEC after the plan is finalized.

Row 11-

When identified by the BEC or Tribal Nations of the BEC as necessary for ceremonies and gatherings, implement actions to minimize potential conflicts with other resource uses that could interfere with ceremonies and gatherings. Sensitive cultural information would be kept confidential and safeguarded from release to the extent allowed by law.

Same as Alternative B, same as Alternative C.

ADDITIONAL TO AGENCY MATRIX Provide land managers opportunities to better understand Tribal perspectives and develop appreciation of Tribal traditional, cultural, and religious values, as well as treaties and other Tribal reserved rights on Federal lands, and encourage them to avail themselves of these opportunities. Federal employees working in BENM will complete the most recent training courses on Tribal relations. Cultural awareness training held or sponsored by Tribes and co-funded by the BLM and USFS will be a mandatory part of collaborative management training for Federal employees working in collaborative management frameworks and under collaborative management agreements with Tribes and Tribal coalitions.

ADDITIONAL TO AGENCY MATRIX Tribal Nations should be invited to attend and participate in agency training courses related to land management topics including, but not limited to: NEPA, lands and realty, rights-of-way, cadastral surveys, wildfire and fuels management, and heritage resources.

ADDITIONAL TO AGENCY MATRIX Where appropriate, agencies will encourage staff working on and in the BENM to attend gatherings sponsored by Tribal entities (of BEC

Tribes), Tribal consortiums, or nonprofit organizations offering specialized knowledge and addressing issues important to Tribes of the BEC.

## **Fire Management**

### **Goals and Objectives**

- Firefighter and public safety are the primary goals in all fire management decisions and actions. The agencies, together with the BEC and Tribal Nations, will implement a consistent, safe, and cost-effective fire management program through appropriate planning, staffing, training, and equipment.
- Fires will be managed to take into account firefighter and public safety as well as benefits and values to be protected that are consistent with the preservation, restoration, and protection of BENM objects and values.
- Fuels would be proactively managed by the BEC and the Agencies in BENM to preserve, restore, and protect BENM objects and values.

### **Management Actions Common to All Action Alternatives**

- Agencies would collaborate with the Tribal Nations and the BEC in planning fuel treatments in the appropriate season and conditions to restore and protect BENM objects and values.
- Through implementation-level fire management planning, fire management objectives and actions will be established for every area with burnable vegetation, based on Traditional Indigenous Knowledge, peer-reviewed science, and consideration of other resource objectives.
- Agencies would collaborate with the BEC to protect culturally modified trees during vegetation treatments and fire suppression, as practicable.
- Emergency stabilization, rehabilitation, and restoration efforts following wildfires will be implemented to protect and sustain cultural resources, public health and safety, and community infrastructure.
- The agencies will work together with the BEC, other partners and impacted groups and individuals to reduce risks to communities and to restore ecosystems.
- Wildland fire would be used to protect, maintain, and enhance resources, and when possible, would be allowed to function in its natural ecological role.
- Appendix I, Desired Wildland Fire Condition and Condition Class, identifies the different fire management allowed for the BENM.
- The Agencies would use best and current available tools, including TIK, peer-reviewed science, and the Wildland Fire Decision Support System, in making strategic and tactical

decisions for fire incidents.

- Agencies and the BEC would protect and/or enhance culturally important plant populations and communities during vegetation treatments.
- ADDITIONAL TO AGENCY Training courses in wildfire and fuels management should include Tribal representatives and incorporate Tribal methods. Vegetation treatments should contract Tribal specialists teams, and Knowledge Holders where possible.
- ADDITIONAL TO AGENCY Agencies will collaborate with the BEC and Tribal Nations to identify areas prioritized for fuels treatments to protect human life and address areas of high risk to cultural and natural resources.
- ADDITIONAL TO AGENCY Agencies would collaborate with the BEC and Tribal Nations to encourage and facilitate firewood gathering to address fuels issues in wilderness areas and areas with sensitive resources.
- ADDITIONAL TO AGENCY Whenever possible, wood/biomass generated by vegetation treatments would be made available for Tribal use.
- ADDITIONAL TO AGENCY MATRIX Agencies would collaborate with the BEC on the appropriateness of wildfire use when areas of spiritual significance or that experience traditional or ceremonial use have the potential to be affected. Appropriate seasons, years, and areas for wildfire use for resource benefit will be determined with the BEC as part of this process to ensure traditional uses can be maintained, allowance can be made for the land to rest, and wildfire can function in its natural ecological role. Fire management would emphasize Traditional Ecological Knowledge and traditional techniques.

## Management Actions by Alternative

### Alternative E

Row 12- Similar to alternative D

Protection of human life would be the primary fire management priority. Establishing a priority among protecting human communities and community infrastructure, other property and improvements, and natural and cultural resources would be based on human health and safety, the values to be protected, and the costs of protection. Fire management decisions and actions would consider the following:

- Protection of cultural resources and/or cultural landscapes.
- Maintaining existing healthy ecosystems and environmental and ecological resources.
- High priority sub basins or watersheds, including watersheds that are impaired or that support important natural or cultural resources.
- Habitat, connectivity, and migration needs of threatened, endangered, or special status species, including culturally important species.

- Protection of riparian, wetland, and water resources would be a priority.
- Agencies would avoid the construction of fire lines within 50 ft of all riparian, wetland and water resources, critical habitat, and cultural sites unless necessary to protect human life and/or BENM objects and values.
- Foam retardant or any other chemical spraying would not be used for fire suppression within 300 feet of perennial water bodies (riparian areas, wetlands, springs) except for protection of public lives. Potential damage to other ecological or cultural resources should be considered when using foam retardant.
- Protection of property.

Row 13- Similar to alternative B

Wildfires may be managed to meet resource objectives except when the following resources and values may be negatively impacted and there are no reasonable resource protection measures to protect such resources and values:

- Areas known to be highly susceptible to post-fire cheatgrass (*Bromus tectorum*) or invasive weed invasion.
- Important terrestrial and aquatic habitats and connectivity and migration corridors
- Riparian habitat
- Non-fire-adapted vegetation communities.
- Sensitive cultural resources.
- Areas of soil with high or very high erosion hazard.
- Administrative sites.
- Developed recreation sites.
- Communication sites (2020 MMP).
- Traditional use sites that might be vulnerable to damage from fire.
- Areas of special spiritual significance to Indigenous communities that would not benefit from fire.
- Fire management in areas of traditional use that might be vulnerable to fire would be identified by the BEC and would emphasize Traditional Indigenous Knowledge and traditional techniques.

Row 14- Similar to alternative B

Fuels and vegetation management in designated Wilderness, Forest Service, recommended wilderness, and Lands Managed for Wilderness Characteristics would be allowed only when determined to maintain, protect, or enhance wilderness characteristics and when approved by the BEC.

## Health and Safety

### Goals and Objectives

- Agencies and the BEC will strive to ensure that human and non-human health and safety concerns on public lands remain a major priority.

### Management Actions Common to all Action Alternatives

- Use, transportation, storage and disposal of hazardous materials would comply with the applicable Federal and State laws. Use of pesticides and herbicides would be used only in accordance with their registered uses and within limitations imposed by Agency and BEC guidance.
- Agencies will collaborate with the BEC to effectively manage hazardous risks on public lands to protect the health and safety of public land users and stewards; protect natural, environmental, and cultural resources; minimize future hazardous and related risks, costs, and liabilities; and mitigate physical hazards in compliance with all applicable laws, regulations, and policies.
- Agencies would collaborate with the BEC to ensure that human health and safety concerns on BENM are appropriately mitigated.
- This management plan recognizes the need to work with Tribal Nations, the BEC, and other partners toward identifying and addressing physical safety and environmental hazards at all Abandoned Mine Lands sites on public lands.
- The BEC and the agencies will collaborate to identify the impact of seasons on health and safety concerns.
- The Agencies would collaborate with the BEC to identify and clean up unauthorized disposals, dumping and shooting areas, campsite fire hazards, and other areas in BENM.
- The BEC and the Agencies will collaborate to identify and monitor potential radioactive contamination in the monument, including monitoring of vegetation, fish and wildlife, and water quality. Where radioactive contamination is detected, appropriate mitigation measures would be co-decided by the BEC and the Agencies.
- Personal risk to visitors from potentially hazardous, (i.e. high, steep, or unstable) sites

would be mitigated through public education, site closures and any other measures identified by the BEC and the Agencies.

## **Lands and Realty**

### **Goals and Objectives**

- Manage lands and realty to protect objects and values identified in Proclamations 9558 and 10285 and consistent with the cultural resources implementation plan.
- The Agencies will retain lands within their administration except where necessary to accomplish resource goals and objectives outlined in the RMP and in Proclamations 9558 and 10285. The Agencies will transfer lands out of federal ownership or acquire non-federal lands or conservation easements only where needed to accomplish resource goals and objectives in the RMP.
- Exchange lands and consolidate ownership if necessary to protect Objects and Values identified in Proclamations 9558 and 10285.
- Acquire necessary rights-of-way to facilitate public access to NFS lands and to meet resource management objectives in the RMP and/or cultural resources implementation plan.
- Acquire scenic or partial easements whenever Federal ownership is not required to meet management objectives.
- Manage all lands and realty consistent with seasonality requirements of other sections of this plan and subsequent implementation level plans.

### **Management Actions Common to All Action Alternatives**

- No lands in the BENM would be available for disposal. Acquisition of lands within the BENM would be pursued with willing sellers or by donation where it would provide for the protection, preservation, or enhancement of the objects and values for which the BENM was designated. Any acquired lands would be managed as a portion of the BENM in the same manner as adjacent lands in the BENM.
- Subject to valid existing rights, the BENM is withdrawn from mineral entry, exploration, leasing, and development.

### **Management Actions by Alternative**

## Alternative E

Row 18:

- No commercial filming would be allowed on the monument. Any other filming would require a permit administered by the agencies and the BEC.
- Aircraft take-offs or landings are prohibited within the BENM, except for administrative and emergency purposes and in locations assigned for this activity via implementation-level travel planning in collaboration with the BEC (i.e. Bluff Canyon, Fry Canyon Airstrip).
- Prohibition on casual drone use throughout the Monument. Agencies shall collaborate with the BEC to determine areas and seasons when drone use may be permitted for Tribal use, administrative use, or emergencies.

Different to Alternative D

Row 19:

No commercial filming would be allowed on the monument. Any other filming would require a permit administered by the agencies and the BEC.

Different from Alternative A, different from Alternative B, different from Alternative C, different from Alternative D

Row 20: Same as Alternative D.

Row 22:

- No aircraft landing or take off in the BENM, except for emergency purposes, administrative purposes, and in locations assigned for this activity via implementation level planning in collaboration with the BEC (i.e. Bluff Canyon, Fry Canyon Airstrip)

Similar to Alternative D.

Row 23: same as Alternative D.

Row 24: same as Alternative A, same as Alternative B, same as Alternative C, same as Alternative D.

Row 25: same as Alternative B, same as Alternative C, same as Alternative D

Row 26: same as Alternative A, same as Alternative B, same as Alternative C, same as Alternative D

Row 27: same as Alternative B, same as Alternative C, same as Alternative D

Row 28: same as Alternative B, same as Alternative C, same as Alternative D

Row 29: same as Alternative B, same as Alternative C, same as Alternative D

Row 30: same as Alternative C, same as Alternative D.
Row 31: same as Alternative B, same as Alternative C, same as Alternative D
Row 32: N/A
Row 33: same as Alternative D
Row 34: same as Alternative B, same as Alternative C, same as Alternative D
Row 35: same as Alternative B, same as Alternative C, same as Alternative D
Row 36: same as Alternative B, same as Alternative C, same as Alternative D

## Special Designations

### Goals and Objectives

#### Areas of Critical Environmental Concern (ACECs)

- Designate, modify, and manage areas as ACECs where special management attention is required to protect and prevent irreparable damage to important historic, cultural, or scenic values, fish and wildlife resources, other natural systems or processes, or to protect life and safety from natural hazards. ACEC designations shall be made in collaboration with the BEC.

#### Traditional Cultural Properties (TCPs)

- In collaboration with the BEC, designate and manage Traditional Cultural Properties to protect tangible and intangible cultural resources, practices, and access for culturally affiliated Tribal Nations.

#### Wild and Scenic Rivers (WSRs) Designations

- To the extent of the BLM's authority (limited to BLM-administered lands within the river corridor), maintain and enhance the free-flowing character, preserve and enhance the ORVs, and allow no activities within the river corridor that would alter the tentative classification of those river segments determined suitable for congressional designation into the National Wild and Scenic River (NWSR) system until Congress acts on the designation.

- Protect the free-flowing nature of the river/segment, the tentative classification level, and prevent impairment of the outstandingly remarkable values within 0.25 mile from high water mark on each side of the river not to exceed 320 acres per mile. On the San Juan River the area would be 0.25 mile from high water mark on the north side not to exceed 160 acres per mile. On the San Juan River, the BLM has jurisdiction on the lands north of the river; and the Navajo Nation has jurisdiction on the southern side of the river. The BLM would coordinate with the Navajo Nation in developing consistent management of the river.

### Wilderness Study Areas

- Manage FLPMA Section 603 WSAs in a manner that does not impair their suitability for congressional designation into the National Wilderness Preservation System.

### Wilderness and Recommended Wilderness

- Preserve the wilderness character of designated wilderness in accordance with the Wilderness Act.
- Protect, maintain and preserve wilderness characteristics for recommended wilderness areas.

## **Management Actions Common to All Action Alternatives**

- Where discretionary authority allows, agencies shall collaborate with BEC and Tribal Nations of the BEC in making special designations (or recommendations for special designations) or altering special designations, including removing any special designations made as part of this RMP. Collaborative designations shall consider seasonally appropriate uses and/or restrictions, as appropriate.
- WSAs would continue to be managed as per BLM Manual 6330, including management as VRM Class I and closed to OHV use (with limited exception, see Travel and Transportation Management (Section 2.1.32)).
- To the extent possible under existing legal authorities (e.g., FLPMA, Clean Water Act, ESA, and Archaeological Resources Protection Act), the BLM would manage eligible and suitable rivers for free-flowing condition, water quality, tentative classification, and any outstandingly remarkable values to assure a decision on suitability can be made for eligible rivers; or in the case of suitable rivers, until Congress designates the river or releases it for other uses. To that end, the BLM has broad discretionary authority, on a case-by-case basis through project-level decision making and the NEPA processes, not to impact river values or make decisions that might lead to a determination of ineligibility or non-suitability.
- Dark Canyon Wilderness Area
  - Description and Values – Within the BENM, the USDA Forest Service currently manages the approximately 47,000 acre Dark Canyon Wilderness that was designated in 1984. Management activities, other than the special provisions in the Wilderness Act, are limited to those deemed necessary to maintaining or enhancing the wilderness character of the area. The area contributes significantly to ecosystem and species diversity and sustainability, serves as habitat for fauna and flora, offers wildlife corridors, provides a reference area, and provides

outstanding opportunities for primitive recreation and solitude. Fire management is used to allow a more natural role in maintaining the ecosystem. The abundant heritage resources are important to the unique character of the wilderness but are not generally interpreted on-site unless necessary for resource protection.

- Goals (DA-WILD-GL)
  - Maintain and promote wilderness volunteer projects and actions to connect the public to the designated wilderness areas and contributions of these lands to ecological and social sustainability.
- Desired Conditions (DA-WILD-DC)
  - Management activities within designated wilderness areas preserve and protect wilderness character as required by the Wilderness Act.
  - Natural ecological processes and disturbances such as succession, fire, avalanches, insects, and disease, are the primary forces affecting the composition, structure, and pattern of vegetation.
  - The Wilderness area provide opportunities for visitors to experience natural ecological processes and disturbances with a limited amount of human influence.
  - The Wilderness area contributes significantly to ecosystem and species diversity and sustainability, serve as habitat for fauna and flora, and offer wildlife corridors, reference areas, primitive recreation opportunities, self-reliance, and places for people seeking natural scenery and solitude.
  - Overnight use does not affect water quality, wildlife, vegetation, cultural resources, or wilderness character.
  - There is little contact with individuals or groups when traveling cross-country. When on trails, encounters with large groups are infrequent, with some encounters with small groups or individuals.
  - Water quality and quantity of seeps, springs, or riparian areas preserve the biological, physical, and chemical integrity of the wilderness ecosystem in which they occur.
  - Outfitter and guides model appropriate wilderness practices and incorporate awareness for wilderness values in their interaction with clients and others. Outfitter and guide recreation special uses support identified public need and provide service for realizing the recreational purposes of the wilderness areas.
  - The Wilderness area is free of noxious weeds.
  - Use within the Peavine Corridor has a minimal effect on adjacent wilderness resources and motorized use stays within the corridor and does not enter the designated wilderness.
- Objectives (DA-WILD-OB)
  - Manage the wilderness to standard based on the Agency's performance accountability measure for wilderness within ten years of plan approval. To achieve this:
    - Prepare a solitude monitoring plan for the wilderness within ten years of plan approval.
    - Complete a capacity study, needs assessment, and extent necessary for determination for commercial recreation special uses in Dark



Rows 179-180

- same as Alternative A.

Row 181-

- same as Alternative B.

Row 182-

- same as Alternative A.

Row 183-

- same as Alternative C.

Row 184-

- same as Alternative C.

Row 185-

- recommend adopting citizen proposed ACEC under evaluation for "John's Canyon" paleontological area

Row 186-

- recommend adopting EPA proposed ACEC for Cedar Mesa aquifer under evaluation

Row 187-

-WSR-4 Eligible WSR segments would continue to be managed according to the tentative classifications and suitability recommendations in the 2008 Monticello Field Office RMP and ROD. WSR evaluations would be continued in collaboration with the BEC regarding

designations.

Suitable – Scenic (Appendix A, Map XXX):

Colorado River Segment 2

Colorado River Segment 3

Suitable – Wild (Appendix A, Map XXX):

Dark Canyon

San Juan River Segment 5

Not identified as suitable (Appendix A, Map XXX):

Arch Canyon

Fable Valley

Indian Creek

San Juan River Segment 1

San Juan River Segment 2

Similar to Alternative B, similar to Alternative C, similar to Alternative D

Row 188-

- same as Alternative B.

Row 189-

- same as Alternative B.

Row 190 - same as Alternative B, same as Alternative C, same as Alternative D

Row 191 - same as Alternative B, same as Alternative C, same as Alternative D

Row 192-

- same as Alternative B Recommend continuing WSR evaluations and collaborate with BEC regarding designations.

Row 193 - same as Alternative B, same as Alternative C, same as Alternative D

Row 194 - same as Alternative B, same as Alternative C, same as Alternative D

Row 195-

- same as Alternative B

Row 196 - same as Alternative A, same as Alternative B, same as Alternative C, same as Alternative D

Row 197 -

Same as Alternative A, same as Alternative B, same as Alternative C, same as Alternative D

Row 198-

Same as Alternative A, same as Alternative B, same as Alternative C, same as Alternative D

Row 199 - Same as Alternative A, same as Alternative B, same as Alternative C, same as Alternative D

Row 200 -

Same as Alternative A.

Row 201 -

Same as Alternative A.

Row 202-

Same as Alternative A, same as Alternative B, same as Alternative C, same as Alternative D

Row 203-

same as Alternative B, same as Alternative C, same as Alternative D

Row 204-

Same as Alternative A, same as Alternative B, same as Alternative C, same as Alternative D

Row 205 -

same as Alternative B, same as Alternative C, same as Alternative D

Row 206-

same as Alternative B, same as Alternative C, same as Alternative D

Row 207-

same as Alternative B, same as Alternative C, same as Alternative D

Row 208-

same as Alternative B, same as Alternative C, same as Alternative D

Row 209-

Same as Alternative B, except that

-Dark Canyon Wilderness would be managed to allow traditional and contemporary Tribal cultural uses.

Row 210-

same as Alternative B, same as Alternative C, same as Alternative D

Row 211-

- Same as Alternative B, except with the following addition:

- Collaborate with BEC regarding management of Cliff Dwellers Pasture Research Natural Area USFS.

## **Recreation Management**

### **Goals and Objectives**

- Tribes of the BEC do not view many modern forms of recreation as a culturally appropriate use of the Bears Ears cultural landscape. Tribal members visit this place for purposes related to ceremony, for hunting and gathering, and to teach young people about their history and culture. Tribal members visit the Bears Ears landscape with reverence and for life-sustaining purposes.
- Traditional Indigenous Knowledge instructs that the Bears Ears cultural landscape should be stewarded as a sacred place, and visitors should be taught to visit the landscape in culturally appropriate ways, as someone would be taught to enter and visit a sacred cathedral, cemetery, or similar western revered and special location. To the Tribes, recreation is not a “resource” of the BENM to be protected in this plan but rather, it is a use of the BENM that can adversely impact or even destroy objects and values if not managed carefully. Agencies and the BEC should carefully manage recreation uses to protect the important cultural value of this landscape for BEC Tribes and in a way that is different from how the Agencies have managed recreational uses in the past. Traditional Indigenous Knowledge provides that the cultural landscape of the Monument requires rest during certain seasons of the year. Agencies shall work with BEC Tribes to undertake appropriate rest and other seasonal uses and/or restrictions on uses.
- If recreation is allowed, it should be concentrated near population centers and highway corridors by placement of appropriate visitor-use infrastructure and visitors should be educated about the appropriate way to visit this landscape based on Tribal expertise and traditional Tribal values. Where absolutely necessary, provide restrooms and other facilities that will be adequate for anticipated uses at designated frontcountry campgrounds, trailheads, and near existing roads. Major developments such as visitor centers and developed camping areas will be located on the periphery of the Monument and in or near local communities instead of within the Monument itself. Limiting development to the periphery will allow visitors to better understand the Monument’s cultural landscape without jeopardizing the objects and values that it was designated to protect. Agencies may allow minor alterations of the viewscape, such as interpretive kiosks, trail signs, pullouts, restrooms, limited parking areas at developed cultural sites, designated dispersed campsites, and other improvements to existing facilities as needed and in specific zones.
- Eliminate terminology that is disrespectful or that diminishes the reverence with which this place should be visited and held, such as “primitive.”
- Agencies and BEC will develop an enforcement strategy to ensure that any management guidelines or prescriptions in this plan are followed by visitors to the Monument.
- The agencies and the BEC will work together to identify potential locations for permissible, informational and educational kiosks, and developed and designated dispersed camping areas. This strategy will “provide appropriate recreational opportunities, education, interpretation, and visitor services to enhance the public’s understanding and enjoyment of the Monument,” while ensuring the conservation, protection, and restoration (where appropriate) of its objects and values. BLM Manual 6220.1.2. It will also help meet another important objective - providing economic opportunities for local communities. Focusing visitor amenities on the periphery of the Monument, and focusing visitor opportunities along its primary travel corridors, will support economic growth in local communities while protecting the cultural landscape and undeveloped nature of the interior of the Monument.

- In collaboration with the BEC, provide interpretation, information, and education for visitors. Emphasize and educate visitors on "Leave No Trace" and "Visit with Respect" practices for all recreation activities throughout the Monument.
- Manage recreation to protect human health and safety while protecting and preserving, BENM objects and values, consistent with the requirements of the Cultural Resources section of this RMP and the cultural resources implementation plans.
- In collaboration with the BEC, manage recreation use in a manner that supports and respects Tribal Nation traditional uses, values, and perspectives and with the reverence appropriate to this cultural landscape.
- BLM and USFS will coordinate and collaborate with the BEC to develop recreation management zones as identified in this MMP and as otherwise needed to protect Monument objects and values and ensure that management of recreation is consistent with the goals and management directives of the cultural resources implementation plan.
- BLM and USFS will work collaboratively with the BEC to design proper cultural resource management practices as they interact with recreational uses, such as recommended closures or limitations on recreational use during certain times of the year to protect Monument objects and values, including wildlife, and as necessary to preclude noise and user conflicts during Tribal traditional and/or ceremonial uses.
- In collaboration with the BEC, where damage to Monument objects and values by recreational use is observed or anticipated, the agencies will implement management tools such as designated campsites, permits, fees, area closures, camping and travel controls, limitations on visitor numbers, timing and duration of use, and other similar actions.
- Unless specifically authorized in this Plan or a future implementation or project-level plan, visitors are not allowed to enter the interior of any cultural site.
- BLM and USFS will work collaboratively with the BEC to develop a permit system which involves user education about the Monument's cultural landscape, the rules and regulations of the Monument, and where users are subject to penalties and fines for permit violations.
- Use on-the-ground presence (agency personnel, site stewards, volunteers, Tribal stewards, Tribal volunteers) as a tool to protect BENM objects and values and provide visitor education regarding the proper care and stewardship of the Bears Ears cultural landscape from the Tribal perspective and according to Tribal expertise.
- The designation of landscape-level management zones will serve as the primary tool for managing visitation and other uses in a manner that is clear and that will safeguard the Monument's cultural landscape. Management zones provide guidance to help define permitted or excluded activities and any stipulations pertaining to them. In this context, zones are tools that guide decision making, resource management, recreational uses, and other activities within the Monument. This complies with the requirement that National Conservation Lands such as National Monuments "will be managed in accordance with applicable laws, regulations and in a manner that protects the values for which the components of the system were designated." BLM Manual 8320 .03.B. The Plan designates four management zones within the Monument:

- **Frontcountry Zones** - the focal point for visitation; located close to communities and along major paved roads that traverse the Monument. This zone will offer day use opportunities from nearby communities via the paved travel

corridors that traverse the Monument. The Frontcountry Zone will accommodate the primary visitation infrastructure, including parking areas, toilets, interpretation sites, overlooks, trails, and related facilities needed to educate the public about the cultural history and ongoing relationship of the Tribal Nations of the BEC to the Monument. Existing high visitation destinations such as Mule Canyon Kiva, Butler Wash Ruins Overlook and Trail, and the Newspaper Rock Panel are included to provide for necessary improvements and to accommodate expected visitation. Lands and resources close to towns such as Monticello, Blanding, Bluff, and Mexican Hat are included to provide for economic opportunities for local communities. Places with objects and values, TCPs, Wilderness areas, Wilderness Study Areas (WSAs), natural areas, lands with wilderness characteristics, ACECs, threatened and endangered species habitat, relict plant areas, riparian areas, and other sensitive resources, will be avoided whenever possible. Frontcountry zones will be monitored by agency staff and Tribal rangers to ensure that management prescriptions are followed.

- o **Passage Zones** – contain secondary travel routes used as throughways and recreation destinations. Secondary travel routes include limited Class B roads (maintained), but no Class D roads (unmaintained). The agencies will generally avoid directing or encouraging further increases in visitation due to the condition of routes and distance from communities. Areas containing objects and values, areas that are objects and values, wilderness, Wilderness Study Areas (WSAs), natural areas, lands with wilderness characteristics, ACECs, TCPS, threatened and endangered species habitat, relict plant areas, riparian areas, and other sensitive resources will be avoided whenever possible.

- o **Outback Zones** - intended for a natural, undeveloped, and self-directed visitor experience while allowing access to trailheads and dispersed camping along designated routes. Interpretive materials will be provided only when essential for education, public health or safety, and/or resource protection. Designated motorized routes not identified within the Frontcountry or Passage Zones may be included in Outback zones. Objects and values, wilderness, WSAs, TCPs, and natural areas will be avoided. Mountain biking should not be allowed on trails in Outback Zones.

- o **Remote Zones** - will offer a natural, undeveloped, and self-directed visitor experience without motorized or mechanized access, except as authorized on designated routes. These zones include areas with high concentration of cultural sites away from roads, wilderness, WSAs, natural areas, ACECs, TCPs and lands with wilderness characteristics, and may also include other unroaded areas outside these designations. Management requirements specific to those designations shall apply. The agencies will provide no facilities and will post only those signs necessary for public safety or resource protection, in collaboration with the BEC. Any signage must be minimal, deemed necessary for resource protection or public safety, and must only be used after other management actions have been exhausted. Facilities and other amenities development is not permitted. The zone is intended to facilitate landscape-scale protections, and links low elevation areas

to higher elevations. These zones are also intended to connect remote and undeveloped areas on surrounding lands managed by other Federal agencies.

- In all zones, in collaboration with the BEC, the agencies will identify and restore disturbed areas, including dispersed campsites, redundant and user created (“social”) trails and routes.
- In all zones, in collaboration with the BEC, the agencies will conduct maintenance, re-routing, improvement, repair, or closure and restoration of disturbed areas, dispersed campsites, and existing routes and trails which are impacting Monument objects and values. The agencies will assess all non-designated routes and trails for compliance, and will take all necessary compliance actions to prevent unauthorized use from occurring.
- Livestock grazing is excluded from developed campsites.
- Developed campsites are unavailable for private and/or commercial use of woodland products including on-site collection of dead wood for campfires.
- All hiking is limited to designated trails or routes established pursuant to SRPs and SUPs.
- Commercial hiking to cultural sites is prohibited in the BENM, except pursuant to SRPs or SUPs.
- Mechanized and motorized use is limited to motorized and mechanized routes to be co-designated by the BEC and the agencies in the travel and transportation implementation level plan.
- Other than for permitted hunting, the discharge of firearms, including target shooting, is prohibited throughout the Monument.
- No swimming or bathing is allowed in or near natural water sources listed as Monument objects, such as springs, streams, potholes, and pools.
- Pets must be kept under control at all times. Pets are prohibited in or at any alcoves, cultural sites, rock writing sites, or other non-developed archaeological sites, and at specific locations as identified in this Plan. Pets must not harass or harm wildlife. Pets must not harass visitors or other visitors’ pets. Pets are prohibited from swimming in springs, potholes, or other natural water sources. Pet waste disposal requirements are identical to human waste disposal requirements.
- Recreational OHV and mechanized travel will be consistent with route and area designations described in this Plan and future recreation and travel management decisions. The BLM and Forest Service will work with appropriate federal agencies, state and local government agencies, and the BEC to develop procedures, protocols, permits for other types of authorization, as appropriate, to provide reasonable access for non-recreational use of OHVs for military, search and rescue, emergency, administrative, and permitted uses.
- The operation of drones within the Monument is prohibited without a permit from the appropriate Forest Service or BLM office. The agencies will collaborate with the BEC concerning the issuance of any permits.
- Paragliding, hanggliding, base jumping, wing suit flying, geocaching, rock-stacking, and other similar activities are inappropriate activities in the Bears Ears cultural landscape according to Tribal expertise and Traditional Indigenous Knowledge and are prohibited. Agencies should direct the public to other areas of public lands outside the Monument to engage in these activities.
- Human and other waste: All users must use restrooms where provided. In areas with no restrooms, users must carry bags or some other portable toilet system, and all human

waste must be packed out. All cans, trash, organic garbage, and burnable refuse including toilet paper must be carried out. Liquid garbage may be discarded 200 feet from any water source. Dishwater must be strained and discarded 200 feet from any camps, trails, and water sources.

- In-canyon use.
  - Overnight and day use in all canyons requires an individual Special Recreation Permit (ISRP).
  - Unless otherwise provided in this Plan or a subsequent implementation level or site-specific plan, private day use groups size and commercial group size limited to 12 people, and overnight private group size is limited to 8 people.
- No competitive or commercial events are allowed.
- Campfires are not permitted except along the San Juan River where firepans are required.
- Commercial and private use allocations will be adaptive and determined based on protection of Monument objects and values, as well as the relative visitor demand for self-supported (private) and guided (commercial) recreation opportunities. Allocations will ensure protection of Monument objects and values while sustaining the viability of both types of visitor opportunities. Caps on visitor numbers and/or group size may be modified as necessary to protect Monument objects and values and other resources.
- Lands within the BENM will not be designated using the traditional BLM Recreation Management Zone framework because they are to be managed “to ensure the protection of the objects and values for which the Monument[...][was] designated,” BLM Manual 6220.1.2.C, and according to Tribal expertise and Traditional Indigenous Knowledge. Procl. 10285. Recreation is a secondary use that may occur, but is not emphasized. Recreation and visitor services “are managed to allow recreation uses that are not in conflict with the primary uses of” the Monument. BLM Handbook 8320-1.F.1.d.(1).

## **Management Actions Common to all Action Alternatives**

- Administer BLM Special Recreation Permits (SRPs) and USDA Forest Service Recreation Special Use Permits (SUPs) to protect and restore, where appropriate, BENM objects and values. Administer permits to manage visitor use, protect recreational and natural resources, and provide for the health and safety of visitors..
- Manage the BENM to provide for the preservation, restoration, and protection of natural quiet that enhances the cultural landscape, where practicable.
- On portions of BENM managed by the USDA Forest Service, the Recreation Opportunity Spectrum (ROS) would be used to manage the settings and opportunities for recreation and to guide management actions. ROS designations using the word “primitive” shall be renamed using a term that is culturally appropriate for areas of the national forest system located within the BENM.
- In addition to specific management prescriptions, access points, trails, and climbing routes that do not impact the preservation, restoration, and protection of BENM objects and values would continue to be allowed. If site-specific impacts exist, climbing routes can be closed and access trails and staging areas may be rerouted. Any closures would be identified in collaboration with the BEC and Tribal Nations of the BEC. Climbing closures would be identified via physical infrastructure and/or kiosks/signs.

### ***Frontcountry and Passage Zones:***

o To protect Monument resources and provide economic opportunities in the local communities, major facilities and the services associated with them will be located in or near these communities Monticello, Blanding, Bluff, and Mexican Hat. Preferably, major facilities will be located outside the Monument; if necessary and in collaboration with the BEC, they may be located in Frontcountry zones on the outskirts of the Monument close to communities. Precise locations will be determined in collaboration with the BEC to ensure that facilities siting decisions are culturally appropriate, and to ensure the protection of Monument objects and values. These determinations will be made by the Tribal Nations of the BEC, the impacted communities, and the BLM and Forest Service.

o Focus the location of public land recreational activities and appropriate visitor-use infrastructure in the Frontcountry zone near population centers and identified primary highway corridors. The BLM and Forest Service, in collaboration with the BEC, will identify areas where restrooms and other facilities may be needed for existing and anticipated uses at designated campgrounds, trailheads, and other areas where there is a concentration of recreational users. Ensure that restrooms are not sited near Monument objects, but at a respectful and appropriate distance away, according to Tribal expertise regarding Monument objects. This is to ensure that Monument objects are not desecrated by proximity to human or animal waste.

o In collaboration with the BEC, the development of new trails may be allowed to encourage a focused visitor experience, and to address increasing visitor use and critical resource protection needs, if consistent with the protection of Monument objects and values. All trails and trailheads shall be constructed to avoid impacts to cultural sites, water sources, culturally significant and/or sensitive plants, soils, wildlife habitat, and other resources. The development of any trailheads, hiking paths and trails are subject to site-specific NEPA.

o In Frontcountry zones, in collaboration with the BEC, existing developed recreation sites may be maintained or improved, and the development of new recreation sites and/or facilities may be allowed to direct recreational use to these areas, encourage a focused visitor experience, and to address current and expected visitation, visitor safety, education, interpretation, and protection of Monument objects and values. The developments of new sites and/or facilities are subject to site-specific NEPA.

o In Passage zones, the BLM and Forest Service, in collaboration with the BEC, may provide basic facilities necessary for visitor health and safety, education, interpretation, and protection of Monument objects and values and other resources. Existing recreational sites and facilities may be maintained or improved. Designated dispersed campsites may be developed.

o Any new trails, sites, facilities and parking areas will be designed to be unobtrusive and to meet visual resource objectives (clarify what this means for these actual changes to these trails, sites, facilities), to ensure that they do not

adversely impact the viewscape, soundscape, and are culturally appropriate (i.e., certain areas of the Monument require more silence and unobstructed views than others, according to Traditional Indigenous Knowledge regarding associated objects)

- o In collaboration with the BEC, the agencies may place educational signs and placards in recreation areas to educate the public about culturally significant plants, other Monument objects and values, and Leave no Trace practices.

***Outback and Remote Zones:***

- o In Outback zones, in collaboration with the BEC, the development of new non-motorized trails and trailheads is discouraged. The development of minor recreation facilities such as trailhead markers and informational kiosks in existing recreation sites is allowed only when essential for education, public safety, and/or protection of Monument objects and values or other critical resource protection needs.

- o In Remote zones, the development of new recreation sites, facilities, and trails is not permitted. Any signage must be minimal, deemed necessary for resource protection or public safety, and must only be used after other management actions have been exhausted.

- **Camping.** The following management actions common to all alternatives apply to camping management throughout the BENM, regardless of zone.

- o The BLM and Forest Service, in collaboration with the BEC, will identify appropriate designated dispersed camping locations to ensure that camping does not impair, degrade, or destroy Monument objects and values.

- o In Frontcountry and Passage zones, camping is restricted to developed campgrounds and specifically designated dispersed camping areas. Unless specifically designated, dispersed camping will not be allowed in these zones. Designated dispersed campsites will not have any developments other than a small sign or barriers to delineate the site and a fire ring if needed for resource protection. Developed campgrounds should have toilet facilities. Vehicles will be confined to using designated pullouts and will not be allowed to pull off the route, except as provided for in emergencies. No luxury camping (i.e. glamping) will be permitted. Unpermitted camping will be eliminated.

- o **Vehicle camping.** Vehicle camping is defined as camping that involves sleeping in a vehicle, such as a van or small self-contained recreational vehicle, or near a vehicle in a tent. In Remote zones, vehicle camping is allowed only in designated campsites along existing designated routes and in compliance with the protection of wilderness characteristics and Monument objects and values. Until dispersed camping sites are designated, no dispersed vehicle camping will be allowed. In Outback zones, vehicle camping is allowed only in existing designated dispersed

campsites. Dispersed camping would be limited to certain designated areas, and disturbed sites will be reclaimed and restored. Large recreational vehicles (greater than 18 ft in length, and/or possessing 3 or more axles including trailers) are prohibited except in campgrounds already designed to accommodate them.

o Backpacking and Backcountry users. All dispersed camping in any zone will be limited to certain designated areas. Sites that are disturbed from previous dispersed camping will be reclaimed and restored.

o The BLM and Forest Service will collaborate with the BEC to identify areas and times for seasonal closures on all camping, to allow for resource rest, traditional uses or ceremonies, to protect wildlife and other Monument objects and values, or as impacts or environmental conditions warrant.

- Collaborate with the BEC when creating or updating recreational permit systems. Permits would include stipulations educating permit holders about the rules and regulations of the BENM and circumstances that give rise to penalties and fines for permit violations.
- No competitive or non-competitive motorized or mechanized events or activities would be allowed in the BENM.
- Development of any recreational use roads, trails, ORV routes, including re-routing of existing trails, facilities, built infrastructure, and other development requiring alteration of the cultural landscape of the BENM shall only occur in collaboration with the BEC and Tribal Nations of the BEC and requires NEPA analysis. Any such development shall comply with the travel and transportation implementation level plan.
- BLM-Administered Recreation – Tribal Traditional Indigenous Knowledge and Tribal cultural resources expertise, requires that there be no “special recreation management zones or areas in the Monument, as the BLM has used in other multiple-use public lands areas,” because those designations elevate management for the benefit of recreational use to an inappropriate level with respect to the cultural landscape of the BENM and the culturally appropriate uses of this area.

## Management Actions by Alternative

<b>Alternative E</b>
Row 78- Limit or prohibit recreation to preserve, restore, and protect BENM objects and values with the following actions: <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Limit or control activities where damage by recreational uses is observed or anticipated through specialized management tools such as , barricades/fences, signs,</li></ul>

and designated campsite areas. If necessary, use permits, area closures, and limitations on number of users and duration of use.

- Coordinate with the BEC, Tribal Nations, federal and state agencies, county and local governments in recreation planning and managing traffic. Notify and coordinate with local governments for search and rescue operations, trash control and removal, and public safety. BEC involvement in these activities will be primarily to advise on the proper care and management of Monument objects negatively impacted by recreation, traffic, and trash control and removal.
- Consider and, where necessary, implement management methods to protect resources, as well as maintain the quality of experience of the various user groups. These methods could include construction of trailheads, and if necessary, limitation of numbers, types, timing, and duration of use.
- Emphasize "Leave No Trace", "Tread Lightly" and "Visit with Respect" visitation, camping and travel techniques throughout the BENM.
- Coordinate management of recreation use with the BEC, Tribal Nations of the BEC, other agencies, state and local government to provide public benefits, help assure public safety, and make effective use of staff and budget resources. Agencies will notify the above entities when a resource or budget shortage may impact management actions, enforcement, or patrolling of the Monument to allow these entities to provide supplemental resources and/or enforcement/patrolling services
- OHV access for game retrieval would follow all area and route designations. There would be no off-road retrieval.
- Dispersed camping would not be allowed in non-designated sites and may be closed seasonally or as impacts or environmental conditions warrant.

Same as above with the following exceptions:

- Encourage the location of public land recreational activities near population centers and highway corridors (Frontcountry) through restrictions on types of recreational use in Backcountry and Remote areas. Provide limited restrooms and other facilities at designated campgrounds, trailheads, and other areas where there is a concentration of recreational users. Major developments such as visitor centers and developed camping areas will be located on the periphery of the Monument and in or near local communities instead of within the Monument itself.
- Focusing visitor amenities on the periphery of the Monument, and focusing visitor opportunities along its primary travel corridors, will support economic growth in local communities while protecting the cultural landscape and undeveloped nature of the interior of the Monument.
- Limit or control activities where damage by recreational uses is observed or anticipated through specialized management tools such as area closures, limitations on type of use, designated campsites, permits, and limitations on number of users and duration of use.
- Use on-the-ground presence (BLM, Tribal ranger programs, site stewards, volunteers) as a tool to protect public lands in locations and as necessary to protect public lands. Collaborate with Tribal Nations of the BEC to engage and contract Tribal site stewards and volunteers to assist with public engagement.
- Consider, where appropriate, implementing management methods to protect the objects

and values of the BENM from damage or destruction by recreational use. These methods could include restricting some or all types of recreational use in areas within the BENM.

Different from agency matrix

ADDITIONAL TO AGENCY MATRIX Row 80-

General Recreation Management

- Partner with agencies, organizations, NGOs and Tribes that manage and/or monitor up or downstream portions of the Colorado River including but not limited to Tribal Nations of the BEC, Canyonlands National Park and the Moab BLM FO to manage the portion of the Colorado River that passes through the monument.
- Partner with agencies, organizations, NGOs and Tribes that manage and/or monitor up or downstream portions of the San Juan River including but not limited to the Tribal Nations of the BEC and Glen Canyon National Recreation Area to manage the portion of the San Juan River that passes through the monument.
- Manage the BLM portion of Dark Canyon Complex in coordination with Manti-La Sal National Forest and Glen Canyon National Recreation Area.

ADDITIONAL TO AGENCY MATRIX Row 81-

Camping fees would be charged if deemed necessary to provide facilities and services. Individual SRPs (ISRPs) (BLM) and SUPs (US Forest Service) for private, non-commercial Special Area use would be required following current Federal Lands Enhancement Modernization Act authority and agency permit and fee administration policy.

Rows 83-85

Agencies would collaborate with the BEC to develop an interpretation plan for recreational visitors to the Monument, with an emphasis on on-site interpretation in Frontcountry and Passage zones. The plan will highlight BEC Tribal Nations' connections to distant areas visible in BENM, culturally important plants, culturally important vantage points, high interest or unique geological, paleontological, biological, archeological, or historical features for public information and, as appropriate, develop interpretive information for these sites.

Interpretation plan developed in coordination with the BEC shall comply with the cultural

resources implementation plan.

Interpretation in Outback and Remote zones would be off-site interpretation unless on-site guidance is required to address impacts to the preservation, restoration, and protection of BENM objects and values.

Similar to Alternative A, Alternative B, Alternative C, and Alternative D

Row 86-

- All solid human waste would be carried out of areas without toilet facilities.

Same as Alternative D

Row 87-ADDITIONAL TO AGENCY MATRIX

Existing developed recreation facilities would be maintained as needed to address visitor impacts and critical resource protection needs. If developed recreation facilities do not preserve, restore, and protect BENM objects and values, they would be removed. New recreation facilities could be developed only in Front Country areas, where necessary to preserve, restore, and protect BENM objects and values as determined by the Tribal expertise of the BEC.

- REC-10 [Same as Alternative B.] - Grazing is excluded from developed recreation facilities, which included developed campgrounds, developed trailheads, and cultural sites that are Public Use (Developed). See also Livestock Grazing Management (Section 2.1.25).
- REC-11 [Same as Alternative A.] - Developed recreation facilities are unavailable for private and/or commercial use of woodland products including on-site collection of dead wood for campfires.

Rows 89-90-

REC-15 Develop, maintain, or improve the following recreation sites to encourage a focused visitor experience and to support preservation, restoration, and protection of BENM objects and values, in collaboration with the BEC and consistent with the cultural resources implementation plan:

- Dry Wash
- Kane Gulch Ranger Station (40 acres)

- Sand Island Campground (21 acres)
- Newspaper Rock Interpretive Site

Subject to applicable law and valid existing rights, the BLM and USDA Forest Service would remove recreation facilities that do not serve an administrative, public safety, recreational, cultural, or historic purpose, or that do not provide for the preservation, restoration, and protection of BENM objects and values. Seasonal closures of these facilities would be considered to allow for resource rest and/or traditional uses or ceremonies. These seasonal closures would be identified in collaboration with the BEC and Tribal Nations. For recreation facilities, Agencies and the BEC would implement the following management:

- Provide for universal accessibility ( i.e. ADA accessibility, inclusion of Indigenous languages in exhibits) to the extent practicable and consistent with the preservation, restoration, and protection of BENM objects and values and desired recreation settings.
- Evaluate specific flood hazards when within identified 100 -year floodplains.
- No developed recreation facilities in Remote or Outback Zones..
- Restrict uses that cause noise levels that create a public nuisance and are disrespectful and inappropriate for the cultural and natural land and soundscape of the monument. Do not designate camping areas within one quarter mile of developed fee camping areas within the BENM.

Different from Alternative A, Different from Alternative B, different from Alternative C, different from Alternative D [provides new list of sites, restrictions that are based on Tribal LMP]

Row 91 - Different from Alternative A, different from Alternative B, different from Alternative C, different from Alternative D [suggests framework for management that is different than what is in agency matrix]

Row 92 –

SRPs and Special Use Permits (SUPs) would be used to manage different types of recreation associated with commercial uses, organized groups and special areas. There shall be no competitive events or vending in the BENM. These recreation uses can include, for example, group events, river guide services, and commercial recreation activities. SRPs and SUPs would be issued as a discretionary action to help meet management objectives, control visitor use, preserve, restore, and protect BENM objects and values, and provide for the health and safety of visitors. Agencies would collaborate with the BEC to educate SRP and SUP holders and participants about the cultural history of the BENM, visitor etiquette, and BENM users about stewardship, interpretation, and education about cultural resources and ways to respectfully interact with the monument. In collaboration with the BEC, Agencies will provide training and certification, including cultural sensitivity training that would be required for all SRP/SUP -authorized guides. Limits on user days and/or numbers of permits, total number of permits

issued for BENM, length of permits, number of participants, and appropriate seasons and use areas would be established for SRP and SUPs in implementation level planning in collaboration with the BEC. All SRPs and SUPs would contain standard stipulations appropriate for the type of activity and would include stipulations necessary to preserve, restore, and protect BENM objects and values, reduce user conflicts, minimize health and safety concerns, and encourage respectful visitation with the monument. Stipulations would be developed in collaboration with the BEC and consistent with preserving, restoring, and protecting BENM objects and values.

Different from Alternative A, different from Alternative B, different from Alternative C, different from Alternative D (because of BEC engagement) [adds in BEC collaboration for SRPs, SUPs]

Rows 93-96 -

The criteria for requiring an SRP include the following (except where stated in RMAs or ROS):

- Non-mechanized/non-stock day use organized group or event of more than 12 people.
- Non-mechanized/non-stock overnight with group or event of more than 10 people, unless in a group site.
- Any riding or pack animal use
- Car camping with more than 5 vehicles or more than 10 people.
- Activities or events with the potential to impact the preservation, restoration, and protection of BENM objects and values.
- Events with the potential for user conflict.
- Events that could impact public health and safety.
- Any individual use that might impact monument objects and values

Similar to Alternative D

Row 98 - different from Alternative A, different from Alternative B, different from Alternative C, different from Alternative D

Rows 99-100

- Within three years of ROD for this plan, the BLM would develop an Indian Creek RAMP to provide management direction for the ERMA, including group size limits, facilities development, and designation of campsites, developed in collaboration with the BEC, to ensure that climbing and climbing related uses in the Indian Creek ERMA are culturally

appropriate and do not adversely impact, degrade, or destroy BENM objects and values.

- Until the RAMP is developed, existing group size camping limitations would remain in place.

Indian Creek Interim Management Actions. Until the RAMP is developed, the BLM will follow these guidelines for managing the Indian Creek area:

- Existing developed recreation facilities would be maintained.
- Camping: Camping would be restricted to designated areas or developed campgrounds.
- Campfires: Campfires would be restricted to fire rings where metal fire rings are available. In dispersed, designated camping (vehicle camping) areas with no metal fire rings, campfires would be limited to fire pans; stone fire rings would not be allowed. No campfires would be allowed in the Lavender Mesa ACEC. The area would be unavailable for private and/or commercial use of woodland products, including on-site collection of dead wood for campfires. Campers must bring in their own wood for campfires.
- Pets: All pets must be leashed at all times.
- Human and other waste: Visitors would be required to use existing bathroom facilities or pack out solid human waste. All cans, trash, organic garbage, and burnable refuse including toilet paper must be carried out. Liquid garbage may be discarded 200 feet from any water source. Dishwater must be strained and discarded 200 feet from any camps, trails, and water sources.
- Motorized use: Lavender Canyon will be closed to motorized use to protect important cultural resources, including Monument objects.
- Climbing: Access points, trails, and climbing routes that do not impact the preservation, restoration, and protection of BENM objects and values would continue to be allowed. The BLM could do any of the following, in collaboration with the BEC:
  - o Use physical infrastructure to educate climbers at climbing access points on potential climbing impacts and how to recreate responsibly and/or self-regulate to avoid impacting these resources.
  - o Work with climbing organizations, Tribes, and SRP holders to increase volunteer monitoring and to educate climbers about the cultural landscape of BENM and identified cultural resources within the Indian Creek area. If site-specific impacts exist, climbing routes can be closed and access trails and staging areas may be rerouted. Any closures would be identified in collaboration with the BEC and Tribal Nations. Climbing closures would be identified via physical infrastructure and/or kiosks/signs.
  - o No new climbing bolts or bolted anchors would be authorized. Bolts on existing open routes could be replaced as needed for safety reasons without prior authorization. All bolts would be painted to limit visual contrast.
  - o Seasonal Climbing Closures: Climbing routes would be closed seasonally as appropriate to protect nesting raptors, other objects identified in the objects and

values list, to provide for natural resource rest, and/or to allow for traditional Tribal uses. Closures would be identified in collaboration with the Tribal Nations and the BEC.

Different from Alternative A, different from Alternative B, different from Alternative C, different from Alternative D [much more closely tied to Tribal LMP in various aspects]

Rows 101-102 - not carried forward (Shash Jaa RMA)

Row 103 - Management actions should carry throughout the Monument.

Different from Alternative A, different from Alternative B, different from Alternative C, different from Alternative D

Row 104-107 -

**Cedar Mesa Management Area** (xxx acres) - the boundaries, goals and objectives, and management actions for this Management Area shall be delineated with the BEC. The primary goal and objective of this area is to protect the dense cultural resources, including Monument objects from the impacts of recreational activities. Specific management is needed to protect cultural resources from recreational impacts.

- Within two years, the BLM will, in collaboration with the BEC, develop Cedar Mesa Management Plan (CMMP) to provide management direction for recreation and other uses, including hiking, camping, backpacking, and other recreational use. The CMMP will include group size limits, facilities and site development, maintenance and improvement, and designation of dispersed campsites. Until the CMMP is developed, existing group size limits and camping limitations will remain in place.
- BLM will collaborate with the BEC to develop interpretive materials specific to the Grand Gulch area. The materials will incorporate themes and stories that the Tribal Nations want to convey to visitors that will focus on information regarding cultural and natural resource protection. The BLM and the BEC will identify the appropriate methods to convey the interpretive materials (signs, printed materials, audio-visual methods) within each management zone.

Different from Alternative A, different from Alternative B, different from Alternative C, different from Alternative D

Row 108 - Mule Canyon/Arch Canyon Management Area with BEC. The boundaries, goals

and objectives, and management actions for this Management Area shall be designated with the BEC. The primary goal and objective of this area is to protect an area dense with cultural resources, including Monument objects, from the impacts of recreation activities, especially given the easy vehicular accessibility to many areas, high level of visitation, and density of significant cultural sites and rock writings. Specific management is needed to protect cultural resources from recreational impacts.

- Within two years, the BLM will, in collaboration with the BEC, develop a Mule Canyon/Arch Canyon Management Plan to provide management direction for recreation and other uses, including hiking, camping, backpacking, and other recreational use. The Plan will include group size limits, facilities and site development, maintenance and improvement, and designation of dispersed campsites. Until the Plan is developed, existing group size limits and camping limitations will remain in place.
- BLM will collaborate with the BEC to develop interpretive materials specific to the Mule Canyon and Arch Canyon areas. The materials will incorporate themes and stories that the Tribal Nations want to convey to visitors that will focus on information regarding cultural and natural resource protection. The BLM and the BEC will identify the appropriate methods to convey the interpretive materials (signs, printed materials, audio-visual methods) within each management zone.

In addition, the following specific allowable uses and management actions apply:

- The Arch Canyon road is permanently closed to motorized use. The Agencies shall collaborate with the BEC regarding Traditional Indigenous Knowledge and Tribal expertise regarding this area, which may require the road to be reclaimed or converted into a non-motorized hiking trail. No mechanized use is allowed.
- In canyon day and overnight use:
  - Private day use is limited to 12 people per day per trailhead, and group size is limited to 12.
  - Private group size for overnight trips is limited to 8 people per day per trailhead.
  - Commercial day use is limited to one commercial group per day per trailhead, and 12 people per group. Commercial overnight group size is limited to 12 people per day per trailhead and one commercial group per trailhead per day.
  - Camping for groups of 8-12 people and for groups with stock animals is limited to designated campsites. Groups of 1–7 people will not have designated campsites and will camp in dispersed campsites.
- Hiking to all cultural sites is limited to designated trails.

Different from Alternative A, different from Alternative B, different from Alternative C,

different from Alternative D

Row 109 - Moon House - the Agencies will collaborate with the BEC regarding the proper care and stewardship of the site identified as Moon House in Presidential Proclamations 9558 and 10285.

Different from Alternative A, different from Alternative B, different from Alternative C, different from Alternative D

Row 110 - **Sand Island Area**

Goals and Objectives

- Protect Monument objects and values, including rock writing panels near campgrounds and river access.
- Coordinate and integrate management with the Navajo Nation, BEC, and the National Park Service to ensure protection of natural and cultural resources.
- Allow for boating and rafting activities regulated through permit issuance.

Prior to the development of management criteria specific to Sand Island Area, the following General Allowable Uses and Management Actions apply:

- BLM will work collaboratively with the BEC to improve trails and fences at Sand Island petroglyph panels.
- Cottonwood and willow harvest is not allowed except for Native American traditional and ceremonial uses.
- The BLM will collaborate with the BEC to evaluate the cultural appropriateness of a hiking trailhead for the River House Ruin site and other areas in the OHV closure area around River House ruin and San Juan Hill.
- The bench above Sand Island Campground (256 acres) is closed to camping.
- Permits are required for all recreational river trips. SRPs may be issued to commercial companies on a five-year designated basis, and may be issued to private users through an annual lottery system.
- Trip size is limited to 25 people total (including crew) for private trips. Commercial group size limits on the San Juan River will remain at 33 people (25 passengers plus 8 guides) per trip.
- Downstream travel is allowed at low, wakeless speed. Upstream travel is prohibited, except for emergency purposes (SPM).
- Launch limits allow approximately 40,000 user/days per year.
- Commercial use is allowed up to 40% of total use.
- Administrative and research use will be authorized on a case-by-case review and determination.
- Minimal visitor services at Sand Island and Mexican Hat ramp areas will be

provided for visitor health and safety and resource protection.

- An MOU will be signed between the NPS/GCNRA and the Navajo Nation. This memorandum will include details on numbers of campsites and their associated permit restrictions.
- Non-Boating Use - With the exceptions of along Lime Creek Road, the Mexican Hat Rock area and Mexican Hat Boat Ramp, vehicle camping is allowed only upstream of Comb Wash. In this area, dispersed vehicle camping is allowed only in designated areas.
- All campers (including backpackers) must carry out all human and other waste.
- ● No vehicle access or mechanized travel is allowed from Comb Wash downstream to Lime Creek and below Mexican Hat Bridge (except for motorized boat use on the river).
- Unavailable for woodland product use, except for limited on-site collection of dead wood for campfires. Woodland use within the floodplain is limited to collection of driftwood for campfires.
- Backpackers in Slickhorn Canyon and Grand Gulch are not allowed to camp within 1 mile of the river.
- Campfires allowed only with a fire pan.

Different from Alternative A, different from Alternative B, different from Alternative C, different from Alternative D

Row 113 - not carried forward [Canyon Rims ORV SRMA]

Row 114 - The Agencies shall collaborate with the BEC regarding any specific management actions required by Traditional Indigenous Knowledge guidance regarding the proper care and management of the areas now known as White Canyon, Dark Canyon, and Butler Wash. The primary management goal for these areas is to protect Monument objects and values, and restore them where appropriate according to Traditional Indigenous Knowledge.

- Within two years, the BLM will, in collaboration with the BEC, develop a White/Dark Canyon/Butler Wash Management Plan to provide management direction for recreation and other uses, including hiking, camping, backpacking, and other recreational use. The Management Plan will include group size limits, facilities and site development, maintenance and improvement, and designation of dispersed campsites. Until the Management Plan is developed, existing group size limits and camping limitations will remain in place.
- BLM will collaborate with the BEC to develop interpretive materials specific to the White Canyon, Dark Canyon, and Butler Wash areas. The materials will incorporate themes and stories that the Tribal Nations want to convey to visitors that will focus on information regarding cultural and natural resource protection. The BLM and the BEC will identify the appropriate methods to convey the interpretive materials (signs,

printed materials, audio-visual methods) within each management zone.

- Within the canyons in these areas, the following limitations apply until the Management Plan is complete:
  - Private day use is limited to 12 people per day per trailhead, and group size is limited to 12.
  - Private group size for overnight trips is limited to 8 people per day per trailhead.
  - Commercial day use is limited to one commercial group per day per trailhead, and 12 people per group. Commercial overnight group size is limited to 12 people per day per trailhead and one commercial group per trailhead per day.
  - Camping for groups of 8-12 people and for groups with stock animals is limited to designated campsites. Groups of 1–7 people will not have designated campsites and will camp in dispersed campsites.
- Hiking to all cultural sites is limited to designated trails.

Different from Alternative A, different from Alternative B, different from Alternative C, different from Alternative D

Row 116 -

**Tank Bench/Black Mesa Management Area** - (xxx acres) - all areas east of the Butler Wash passage zone to the Monument boundary, Hwy 95 to the North, and Hwy 191 to the South.

- This entire management area will be managed as an Outback Zone.

Different from Alternative A, different from Alternative B, different from Alternative C, different from Alternative D

Row 118 - ***Valley of the Gods Passage Zone*** (xxx acres) - along the Valley of the Gods Road

- Manage to maintain scenic driving and dispersed camping recreation activities, with a focus on enhancing visitor facilities in limited areas for the protection of monument objects and values, and maintenance of predominantly backcountry physical recreation setting.
- Recreation use rules, regulations, and ethics are clearly posted at major access points and on-site interventions are the primary means for managing visitation.
- Vehicle camping is limited to designated dispersed campsites along designated

routes.

- Campfires only allowed in agency provided fire rings in designated campsites.

Different from Alternative A, different from Alternative B, different from Alternative C, different from Alternative D

Row 120 - ADDITIONAL TO AGENCY MATRIX BEC recommends delineating a management area specific to lands managed by the U.S. Forest Service and incorporating the same zoned management approach as used in the areas under BLM management. This would include designations equivalent to frontcountry, passage, outback and remote zones. The passage zone could include:

Cottonwood Road from the eastern forest boundary to the intersection with Elk Ridge Road, then along Elk Ridge Road the southwestern forest boundary.

The outback zone could include all areas outside of the Dark Canyon Wilderness Area and Inventoried Roadless Areas.

The remote zone could include the Dark Canyon Wilderness Area and all Inventories Roadless Areas.

Different from Alternative A, different from Alternative B, different from Alternative C, different from Alternative D

Row 122 - Doll House. ADDITIONAL TO AGENCY MATRIX The Agencies shall collaborate with the BEC to ensure that management of this site is consistent with Traditional Indigenous Knowledge and Tribal expertise.

Different from Alternative A, different from Alternative B, different from Alternative C, different from Alternative D

Row 123 - lands outside RMAs. See management actions common to all alternatives.

Different from Alternative A, different from Alternative B, different from Alternative C, different from Alternative D

Row 124 - ADDITIONAL TO AGENCY MATRIX

**Additional Management Zone Designations**

***Frontcountry Zones (suggested)***

***Highway 95 Trail of the Ancients Frontcountry Zone*** - (xxx acres) Along the Highway 95 corridor from the entrance to the Monument southwest of Blanding to the western boundary of the Monument.

- BLM will collaborate with the BEC to preserve and, if appropriate, restore the Mule Canyon and Butler Wash archaeological sites, and Salvation Knoll historical site to protect the sites while providing for a quality visitor experience. Add signs about culturally significant plants, improve interpretation, and add user regulations.
- BLM will collaborate with the BEC and the State to preserve, and if appropriate, restore the Cave Towers archeological site to protect the site while providing for a quality visitor experience. Add signs about culturally significant plants, improve interpretation, and add user regulations.
- BLM will collaborate with BEC to designate Frontcountry campsites and dispersed campsites along Highway 95.

***Highway 261 Frontcountry Zone*** - (xxx acres) from the intersection with Highway 95 south to the 2023 boundary of the Monument.

***Highway 275 Frontcountry Zone*** - (xxx acres) From the intersection with Highways 95 and 276 to the boundary of Natural Bridges National Monuments.

***Highway 276 Frontcountry Zone*** - (xxx acres) From the intersection with Highway 95 southwest to the 2023 boundary of the Monument.

- No developed campgrounds or other major recreational facilities will be constructed in this zone.

***Highway 163 Trail of the Ancients Scenic Byway Frontcountry Zone*** - (xxx acres) From the southeast boundary of the Monument west of Bluff to the boundary of the Monument near Mexican Hat.

***Highway 316 Frontcountry Zone*** - (xxx acres) From the intersection with Highway 163 to the Goosenecks State Park.

- BLM will work collaboratively with the Tribal Nations of the BEC and the State to manage dispersed and developed camping and other recreation activities to protect Monument objects and values and the San Juan River viewshed.

***Butler Wash Road Passage Zone*** (xxx acres) - along Butler Wash Road to intersection with US 163.

- Camping is limited to designated dispersed campsites, with designated access routes and parking. *(Existing camping limitations remain in effect until superseded by*

*the CMMP or other future implementation-level planning).*

- Parking for day use is limited to designated parking areas at trailheads.
- BLM will work collaboratively with the BEC to improve roads, parking, and campsites in all areas of Butler Wash.
- BLM will work collaboratively with the BEC to create interpretive material for the Butler Wash dinosaur track site that includes values and interpretations of the Tribal Nations of the BEC about dinosaurs and paleontological history.
- BLM will work with the BEC to construct fences around petroglyphs at Procession Panel to create a buffer between visitors and the panel.
- Private day use and commercial group size limited to 12 people; overnight private group size is limited to 8 people.
- Trails from designated parking areas will be designated and signed. Hiking is limited to designated trails.

**Comb Ridge Road Passage Zone** (xxx acres) - along Comb Ridge Road to intersection with US 163.

- The BLM will collaborate with the BEC to improve the Comb Wash camping area, the lower Fisher Creek trailhead, and other recreation sites as needed.
- Camping is limited to designated dispersed campsites, with designated access routes and parking. *(Until campsites are designated, existing camping limitations remain in effect until superseded by the CMMP or other future implementation-level planning).*
- Parking for day use is limited to designated parking areas at trailheads.
- Private day and commercial group size limited to 12 people, and overnight private group size is limited to 8 people.
- Trails from designated parking areas will be designated and signed. Hiking is limited to designated trails.

**Snow Flat Road Passage Zone** (xxx acres) - road bisecting Fish Creek Canyon and Road Canyon WSAs.

- Camping is limited to designated dispersed campsites, with designated access routes and parking. *(Existing camping limitations remain in effect until superseded by the CMMP or other future implementation-level planning).*
- Parking for day use is limited to designated parking areas at trailheads.
- Camping for Moon House/McLoyd Canyon is limited only to the designated primitive camp and park area south of the Snow Flat Road. Camping is prohibited outside of this primitive camp area. Campfires are not allowed at this camp area. See additional requirements for Moon House/McLoyd Canyon in the Cedar Mesa Primitive Zone.
- Private day use and commercial group size limited to 12 people, and overnight private group size is limited to 8 people.
- Trails from designated parking areas will be designated and signed. Hiking is limited to designated trails.

***Cedar Mesa Outback Zones*** - (xxx acres) - includes all areas not already designated as Frontcountry, Outback, and Primitive zones (areas not designated as WSA, LWC, or MNA).

***Comb Ridge Outback Zone*** (xxx acres) - between Butler Wash and Comb Ridge Roads (*does not include area south of US 163*)

- Parking for day use is limited to designated areas.
- Dispersed camping is allowed in already disturbed sites. Camping could be limited to certain designated areas if resource or cultural damage occurs.
- Private and Commercial day use groups are limited to 12 individuals.
- Overnight private and commercial group size limited to 8 people and primitive campsites will be designated.
- A permit system will be developed for private and commercial day and overnight use.
- Campfires are not allowed in canyons. Outside of canyons, campfires are allowed only at designated campsites. Firepan required.
- Trails from parking areas to cultural sites will be designated and signed.

***Cedar Mesa Remote Zone*** (xxx acres) - Fish Creek Canyon WSA, Road Canyon WSA, Fish and Owl Creeks LWC, Road Canyon LWC, Lime Canyon LWC WSA, Road Canyon LWC, Valley of the Gods ACEC

- Apply general allowable uses and management actions, and those for remote management zones, camping, stock use, and permits. In addition, the following specific allowable uses and management actions apply:
  - In canyon day and overnight use:
    - Private day use is limited to 12 people per day per trailhead, and group size is limited to 12. Private group size for overnight trips is limited to 8 people per day per trailhead.
    - Commercial day use is limited to one commercial group per day per trailhead, and 12 people per group. Commercial overnight group size is limited to 12 people per day per trailhead and one commercial group per trailhead per day.
    - Camping for groups of 8-12 people and for groups with stock animals is limited to designated campsites. Groups of 1–7 people will not have designated campsites and will camp in dispersed campsites.
    - Pets are not allowed in Fish and Owl Creeks above the confluence.
  - Moon House/McLoyd Canyon occurs within the Fish Creek Canyon WSA and is managed under current WSA policy. In addition to WSA management requirements, the following prescriptions apply:
    - Hiking to Moon House is limited to the designated trail and by permit only.

- Campfires, pack animals and pets are not allowed.
- No overnight use is allowed. McLoyd Canyon is closed to overnight use from the head of the canyon to UTM 607100E, 4143495N (2020 MMP).
- Hiking to all cultural sites is limited to designated trails.
- Restrict vehicular access to the rims of Cedar Mesa, encourage access by foot.
- Stock Use:
  - In canyon overnight and day use is restricted to 12 individuals and 8 animals (pack and/or saddle).
  - In permitted canyons, no new trails will be established for stock use. Use is restricted to existing trails and routes in areas open to recreational stock use.

**Grand Gulch Management Area** - Hwy 261 on the east, Hwy 276 on the north and west, BENM boundary on the west (west of Hwy 276) and south.

**Goals and Objectives**

- Protect, enhance and restore Monument objects and values while managing recreation.

**General Allowable Uses and Management Actions**

- Unless otherwise provided in this section, allowable uses and management actions shall be consistent with those identified in this Plan.
- Within two years, the BLM will, in collaboration with the BEC, develop a Grand Gulch Management Plan (GGMP) to provide management direction for recreation and other uses, including hiking, camping, backpacking, and other recreational use. The GGMP will include group size limits, facilities and site development, maintenance and improvement, and designation of dispersed campsites. Until the GGMP is developed, existing group size limits and camping limitations will remain in place.
- BLM will collaborate with the BEC to develop interpretive materials specific to the Grand Gulch area. The materials will incorporate themes and stories that the Tribal Nations want to convey to visitors that will focus on information regarding cultural and natural resource protection. The BLM and the BEC will identify the appropriate methods to convey the interpretive materials (signs, printed materials, audio-visual methods) within each management zone.

***Grand Gulch Frontcountry Zones*** - these areas are along 95, 261, 276, and 313, and are discussed separately.

***Grand Gulch Outback Zones*** - (xxx acres) - includes all areas outside of Frontcountry and Primitive zones (areas not designated as WSA, LWC, or MNA).

- Apply general allowable uses and management actions, and those for Outback management zones, camping, stock use, and permits. In addition, the following specific allowable uses and management actions apply:

- The BLM will collaborate with the BEC to improve the Todle Canyon, Bullet Canyon, and Slickhorn Canyon #1 and #4 trailheads.

***Grand Gulch Remote Zone*** - Includes the Grand Gulch ISA Complex WSA, Grand Gulch LWC, Grand Gulch MNA, Nokai Dome East MNA, and portions of the Mancos Mesa MNA within the Monument.

- Apply general allowable uses and management actions, and those for primitive management zones, camping, stock use, and permits. In addition, the following specific allowable uses and management actions apply:

- In canyon day and overnight use:

- Private day use is limited to 12 people per day per trailhead, and group size is limited to 12. *(Existing group size limits will remain in effect until superseded by the GGMP or other future implementation-level planning).*
- Private group size for overnight trips is limited to 8 people per day per trailhead.
- Commercial day use is limited to one commercial group per day per trailhead, and 12 people per group.
- Commercial overnight group size is limited to 12 people per day per trailhead and one commercial group per trailhead per day.
- Camping for groups of 8-12 people and for groups with stock animals is limited to designated campsites. Groups of 1-7 people will not have designated campsites and will camp in dispersed campsites.
- In canyon camping could be limited to certain designated areas if resource or cultural damage occurs.
- Backpackers in Slickhorn Canyon and Grand Gulch are not allowed to camp within 1 mile of the river.

- Hiking to all cultural sites is limited to designated trails.

- Restrict vehicular access to the rims of canyons, encourage access by foot.

**Mancos Mesa Management Area** - (xxx acres) Entire area is managed as a Remote Zone.

- Unless otherwise provided in this section, allowable uses and management actions shall be consistent with those identified in this Plan. However, due to easy vehicular accessibility to many areas, high level of visitation and popularity, and density of significant cultural sites and rock art. Specific management is needed to protect cultural resources from recreational impacts.
- Within two years, the BLM will, in collaboration with the BEC, develop a Mancos Mesa Management Plan to provide management direction for

recreation and other uses, including hiking, camping, backpacking, and other recreational use. The MMMP will include group size limits, facilities and site development, maintenance and improvement, and designation of dispersed campsites. Until the MMMP is developed, existing group size limits and camping limitations will remain in place.

- BLM will collaborate with the BEC to develop interpretive materials specific to the Mancos Mesa area. The materials will incorporate themes and stories that the Tribal Nations want to convey to visitors that will focus on information regarding cultural and natural resource protection. The BLM and the BEC will identify the appropriate methods to convey the interpretive materials (signs, printed materials, audio-visual methods) within each management zone.
- Apply general allowable uses and management actions, and those for Primitive management zones, camping, stock use, and permits. In addition, the following specific allowable uses and management actions apply:
- Moqui Canyon is closed to motorized and mechanized use. The BLM will collaborate with the BEC to establish a parking area and associated hiking trail and trailhead to allow for non-motorized access into this area.
- In canyon day and overnight use:
  - Private day use is limited to 12 people per day per trailhead, and group size is limited to 12.
  - Private group size for overnight trips is limited to 8 people per day per trailhead.
  - Commercial day use is limited to one commercial group per day per trailhead, and 12 people per group. Commercial overnight group size is limited to 12 people per day per trailhead and one commercial group per trailhead per day.
  - Camping for groups of 8-12 people and for groups with stock animals is limited to designated campsites. Groups of 1–7 people will not have designated campsites and will camp in dispersed campsites.
- Hiking to all cultural sites is limited to designated trails.

#### ADDITIONAL TO AGENCY MATRIX:

- Enforce firearms and weapons restrictions in the Monument, to ensure health and safety of visitors and protect the cultural landscape of the BENM.

## **Travel and Transportation Management**

### **Goals and Objectives**

- Manage the transportation system so it provides safe and reasonable access while preserving and protecting BENM objects and values, acknowledging that travel and transportation impacts BENM objects and values, like air quality, the viewscape, wildlife,

vegetation, and the soundscape. Fugitive dust can negatively impact the visual and ecological aspects of the BENM cultural landscape.

- Support a culture of surface travel user stewardship and conservation of the landscape during user travel.
- ADDITIONAL TO AGENCY. Ensure that travel and transportation management facilitate appropriate use and interaction with the cultural landscape of BENM. Travel and transportation are not “resources” to be protected in the BENM; rather, they are uses that can and should support education and protection of BENM objects and values.
- ADDITIONAL TO AGENCY. Collaborate with the BEC to develop a travel and transportation implementation level plan that protects, preserves and restores BENM objects and values. This may require temporary or permanent route closures.

### **Management Actions Common to All Action Alternatives**

- Identify the entire BENM as a travel management area for the purposes of current and future travel management (2020 MMP).
- Prohibit unauthorized cross-country OHV travel in BENM.
- Except for emergency or authorized administrative purposes, motorized and non-motorized mechanized vehicle use would be allowed only on roads and trails designated for such use, consistent with the preservation and protection of BENM objects and values. Such use shall facilitate restoration of BENM objects and values.
- Designation of new roads or trails for public motorized vehicle use must be limited to routes necessary for public safety or preservation, restoration, and protection of BENM objects and values. No new roads or trails shall be designated or opened until the agencies have collaborated with the BEC, to ensure that new roads and trails will be culturally appropriate.
- The system of roads and trails would be well marked, preserve, restore, and protect BENM objects and values, promote safety, and minimize conflict among various user groups while accommodating appropriate access.
- During implementation-level travel management, ensure that designated roads and trails would be designed and/or modified to ensure the preservation, restoration, and protection of BENM objects and values, including aquatic, riparian, and upland resources.
- Easements necessary to provide for public and administrative access would be acquired and maintained, consistent with preserving, restoring, and protecting BENM objects and values.
- Plan and coordinate the maintenance and monitoring of roads and trails with local governments, partners, and volunteers.
- For NFS lands, administrative level 1 roads would not be used by the public, except where they are dual designated as motorized trails. Gates or other barriers would be installed to manage use of these administrative level 1 roads.
- Motorized aircraft (including but not limited to fixed wing aircraft, helicopters, powered paragliders, electric aircraft, unmanned aircraft and drones) are managed as OHVs (43 CFR 8340). Take-off and landing locations are limited to locations assigned for the activity via implementation-level travel planning in collaboration with the BEC.
- Agencies would collaborate with the BEC to identify seasonal motorized use area

closures as needed.

## Management Actions by Alternative

### Alternative E

<p>Row 234 - Entire BENM is a travel management area subject to a future travel management plan developed in collaboration with the BEC. Same as Alternative B, same as Alternative D</p>
<p>Row 235-236 – Same as Alternative B , but include “and only after collaborating with the BEC to ensure that any new roads are appropriate for cultural uses of the BENM cultural landscape.”</p>
<p>Row 237 – Similar to Alternative C:  Use would be limited to the following designated airstrips: Bluff Airport and Fry Canyon Airstrip. With the exception of these designated strips, no aircraft take-offs or landings would be allowed within the BENM. Administrative and emergency take-offs and landings may be permitted. Seasonal closures of these airstrips may be used to prevent disruption to raptor breeding and nesting.  No new backcountry airstrips would be developed or designated.  Unauthorized drone and other UAS take-off and landing is prohibited. Authorization for UAS use in these closed areas would be by permit or letter of authorization from the agencies and the BEC and would only be allowed in cases where UAS use is beneficial to preserving, restoring, and protecting BENM objects and values.</p>
<p>Row 238 – Same as Alternative B: Until an implementation-level travel management plan is completed, for OHV limited areas, route designations in the 2008 Monticello TMP (for BLM-administered lands as shown in the Monticello RMP Appendix B Map B-6 and Map B-15) and the current Motor Vehicle Use Map (for NFS lands) would remain in effect.</p>

Row 239 –

Implementation-level travel planning would not designate new motorized and mechanized routes in riparian areas or 100-year floodplains unless necessary to ensure the preservation, restoration, and protection of BENM objects and values and only after collaboration with the BEC to determine culturally appropriate routes. Implementation-level travel management planning would ensure motorized and mechanized routes that parallel or cross streams would be located to best complement riparian and aquatic ecosystems as well as road/trail and stream geometry. This includes locating crossings (fords) at points of low bank slope and firm surfaces wherever practicable.

Different from Alternative A, different from Alternative B, different from Alternative C, different from Alternative D

Row 240 -

Implementation-level travel planning would be done in collaboration with the Tribal Nations and the BEC. It would consider BENM objects and values, including traditional uses and would incorporate indigenous ecological knowledge in the determination of which routes to designate, develop, or close. Details regarding resource-specific criteria for implementation-level travel planning are provided, as applicable, in the respective resource sections of this matrix.

Same as Alternative B, same as Alternative C, same as Alternative D

Row 241 –

Acquired lands would be managed consistent with the manner in which the surrounding BENM lands are managed.

Different from Alternative A, different from Alternative B, different from Alternative C, different from Alternative D

Row 242 –

Mechanized travel would be limited to routes where OHV use is allowed.

Same as Alternative D.

Row 243 –

Until the implementation of the Travel Management Plan, allow the following trails only non-motorized and non-mechanized use as identified in the 2008 Monticello TMP (for BLM-administered lands), as amended, and USDA Forest Service system trails, as amended. Livestock use would follow the restrictions laid out in the recreation and livestock grazing sections.

Open to Foot Travel: Kane Gulch, Todie Canyon, Bullet Canyon, Shieks Canyon, Government Trail, Collins Canyon, Slickhorn Canyon, Point Lookout Canyon, Grand Gulch (from junction to San Juan River), Fish Canyon, Owl Canyon, Road Canyon, McLoyd Canyon, Lime Creek Canyon, North Mule Canyon, South Mule Canyon, Lower Mule Canyon from Comb Wash, Mule Canyon or Cave Canyon Towers, Arch Canyon, Johns Canyon, Honaker Trail, Dark Canyon (Sundance Trail), Fable Valley Trail, Salt Creek Mesa Trail, Butler Wash Interpretative Trail, Sand Island Petroglyph Trail, Shay Canyon Petroglyph Trail, Newspaper Rock Trail, Salvation Knoll Trail, Monarch Cave Trail, Fish Mouth Trail, Cold Springs Trail, Procession Panel Trail, Wolf Man Panel Trail, Moon House Trail, Ball Room Cave Trail. Bridger Jack Mesa, Super Crack Buttress, Cat Wall, Broken Tooth Wall, Scarface, Battle of the Bulge, and trails added subsequently.

See livestock section for stock day overnight and day management prescriptions.

Non-motorized trails on NFS lands: Allen Canyon, Arch Canyon, Blue Creek, Blue Creek-Tuerto Canyon, Blue Creek-Allen Canyon, Lower Bob Parker Peak, Brushy Knoll Trail, Butts Canyon, Chippean Canyon, Cream Pots Trail, Dark Canyon Trail, Doll House Trail, Dry Wash Trail, East Rim Texas, Hammond Canyon, Hop Creek, Horse Pasture, Lyman Canyon, Maverick Point/Mormon Pasture, Mule Canyon, Kigalia Canyon, Lewis Lodge Trail, Peavine Canyon, Posey Canyon, Posey Trail (Elk Ridge to Hammond Canyon), Redd Pasture, Rig Canyon, Ruin Park, Salvation Knoll, Shay to Skyline, Short Point Trail, Skyline, South Elk Ridge, Texas Canyon, Trough Canyon, Trail Canyon, Twin Springs, Tuerto Canyon, West Rim Texas Canyon, and Woodenshoe Canyon.

Maintain designated trails for non-motorized and non-mechanized use, including brushing, tread stabilization, installation of routine signs, markers, culverts, ditches, waterbars, gates; placement of recreational, special designation, or information signs; and visitor registers, kiosks, and portable sanitation devices as needed to preserve, restore, and protect BENM objects and values.

Additional non-mechanized and non-motorized routes may be added through subsequent planning at the activity plan level on a case-by-case basis.

Nonmechanized and non-motorized travel is not restricted on public lands except where limited or prohibited to protect specific resource values, provide for public safety, or maintain an identified opportunity.

Same as Alternative B, same as Alternative C, same as Alternative D

Row 249 –

There are no exceptions that allow for cross-country travel for game retrieval or antler gathering in areas designated as limited or closed. OHV use for game retrieval would adhere to all OHV classifications.

Same as Alternative A, same as Alternative B, same as Alternative C, same as Alternative D

Row 250 –

In addition to 43 CFR 8341.2, in OHV limited areas, where the Agencies, in collaboration with the Tribal Nations and the BEC, determine that OHVs are causing or would cause considerable adverse impacts to the preservation, restoration, and protection of BENM objects and values, including traditional uses and resources and areas important for traditional ceremonies, the Agencies would close or otherwise restrict OHV use such areas.

In OHV limited areas, OHV limitations, including seasonal closures, would be identified during travel management planning, in collaboration with the BEC, to allow for resource rest and/or traditional uses or ceremonies and to comply with 43 CFR 8342.1.

Same as Alternative A, same as Alternative B, same as Alternative C, same as Alternative D

Row 251 –

Until the implementation of the Travel Management Plan, within the OHV limited area in Fish Creek WSA, OHV use of the existing so-called primitive route could continue as long as it does not impair wilderness suitability or impact the preservation, restoration, and protection of BENM objects and values. If use and/or noncompliance are found through monitoring efforts to impair the area's suitability for wilderness designation or if it impacts the preservation, restoration, and protection of BENM objects and values, the Agencies would collaborate with the BEC and Tribal Nations to identify appropriate actions and any changes in the Travel and Transportation Management Plan.

Other routes in WSAs may remain available for administrative access (not for public OHV use), including:

- Two so-called primitive routes in Grand Gulch ISA-Pine Canyon and Slickhorn units: totaling 3.1 miles and located east of Pine Canyon and Point Lookout areas.
- One so-called primitive route in Fish Creek WSA-Lower Baullie Mesa; totaling

4.93 miles.

- One so-called primitive route in Road Canyon WSA-Perkins Point; totaling 2.67 miles.

Use of the term primitive to define a category of roads should be phased out.

Different from Alternative A, different from Alternative B, different from Alternative C, different from Alternative D

Row 252

The Manti-La Sal will follow the Forest Plan and the 2005 Travel Management Rule. All route development on NFS lands will be done in collaboration with the Tribal Nations and the BEC and will be consistent with BENM objects and values and traditional and ceremonial uses. This carries through all rows of matrix for USFS-managed lands.

OHV Designation Areas would be co-decided by the agencies and the BEC.

Different from agency matrix

Row 253 - Manti LaSal SUP Same as Alternative B, same as Alternative C, same as Alternative D

## **Livestock Grazing**

### **Goals and Objectives**

- From the Tribal perspective, livestock grazing in the BENM is an introduced activity that, unless very carefully managed for sustainable use, poses harm to the Monument objects and values identified in Presidential Proclamations 9558 and 10285. Livestock grazing can adversely impact cultural resources, including archaeological sites, springs, plants and wildlife and can negatively impact the cultural practices of Tribal members visiting the BENM to conduct ceremonies, gather plants, hunt, reconnect with the landscape, and heal. In keeping with this perspective, the impacts of grazing on many aspects of the landscape, and increased landscape pressures expected from climate change, should be addressed in future implementation level planning in collaboration with the BEC.
- If livestock grazing is allowed to continue, the agencies should require sustainable grazing that does not impede or impair the legally mandated protection, restoration, and enhancement of the Monument's objects and values. [from BEITC LMP App. C, p. 6, #1]
- Monitor rangeland conditions and adapt grazing practices as necessary to maintain or

make progress toward long-term rangeland health, including phased reductions in the overall number of livestock grazing in the Monument. [from BEITC LMP App. C, p. 6, #2]

- Manage grazing to maintain and restore soils, hydrology, and a healthy and diverse vegetation and wildlife community to promote long-term ecosystem sustainability. Manage grazing to minimize or eliminate intrusion of nonnative grass and plant species due to grazing related activities.
- Protect BENM objects and values from degradation caused by domestic livestock or activities associated with grazing of domestic livestock. Allotment AUMs may be modified or allotments may be made unavailable for grazing if they do not meet this purpose.
- Manage grazing according to standards and guidelines co-designed by the BEC to protect cultural resources, including objects and values, according to Traditional Indigenous Knowledge of the BENM, and peer-reviewed western scientific principles.
- Improve enforcement of grazing activity, collaborate with the BEC regarding enforcement goals and targets, and work to secure funding to accomplish enforcement goals.

### **Management Actions Common to All Action Alternatives**

- Coordinate with the BEC on reviewing existing range management and identifying areas for improvement. This should include sharing information with the BEC regarding allotment monitoring, rangeland health assessments, and information regarding permittee compliance with grazing regulations and the management prescriptions of this plan. This should also include coordinated site visits to grazing allotments to assess and document the impacts of grazing on cultural resources and the cultural landscape, including objects and values.
- Assess grazing practices in the BENM to determine whether existing practices are allowing the introduction of nonnative grass, plant, and insect species into the BENM and if so, develop best practices to reduce this spread.
- Analyze the effects of livestock management (e.g. percent utilization, stocking rate, season of use) on Monument soils, hydrology, cultural sites, visual resources, and native vegetation and wildlife communities.
- If monitoring indicates that domestic livestock grazing is adversely impacting BENM objects and values, appropriate changes to livestock grazing management would be used to eliminate those impacts.
- Ensure that permittees comply with the requirements of this plan and any implementation level planning or guidance developed in collaboration with the BEC.
- In collaboration with the BEC, create/revise Range Management Plans/Allotment

Management Plans (AMP) for grazing allotments within the BENM. All allotments will have an updated AMP within 5 years of publication of the Monument Management Plan.

- Educate the public about avoiding conflict with livestock and manage livestock grazing to avoid conflicts with recreational users to the extent practicable [from BEITC LMP App. C, p. 6, #5].
- Voluntary grazing relinquishments would be retired pursuant to Proclamation 10285, which states that should grazing permits be voluntarily retired by existing holders, the Secretaries shall retire from livestock grazing the lands covered by such permits. Forage shall not be reallocated for grazing purposes unless the Secretaries specifically find that such reallocation would advance the purposes of Proclamation 10285 and Proclamation 9558. Tribal expertise should inform any decision about reallocation of relinquished allotments or parts of allotments.

### **Management Actions by Alternative**

Row 39-

Utilization levels of key forage species would be identified on an allotment-specific basis and utilization levels would be managed to meet the goals and objectives in this plan and the cultural resources implementation plan. Grazing surveys shall be completed within 2 years of the release of this MMP assessing appropriate utilization levels and baselines.

Assessments of allotment capacity must take into consideration the forage needs of wildlife. Assessments of allotment use also must comply with this Plan, agency guidance, and any implementation level planning for the BENM.

Similar to Alternative D.

Row 40-

No new water source development for domestic livestock would be authorized on the BENM unless the agencies and the BEC make a prior determination that the development would not impair, damage, or destroy objects and values. Where feasible, existing water developments would be removed unless they preserve, restore, and protect BENM objects and values and can show that they do not impact existing springs, seeps, or other surface or ground waters.

Exclosures or other physical barriers must be in place to prevent livestock from directly accessing or impairing springs, seeps, and other sensitive riparian areas.

This does not preclude the installation of water catchments for wildlife; although if water catchments for wildlife are installed, they should be installed in a manner that precludes domestic livestock from accessing them and ensures that wildlife do not become entrapped within the catchment structure.

Water wells, stock tanks and catchments that are no longer in active use should be capped or

covered for safety purposes.

Similar to Alternative D, except for exclosures sentence.

Row 41-

New range improvements would only be allowed if they support sustainable grazing practices and reduce negative impacts to the cultural landscape, including vegetation, wildlife, soil, and other important ecological and cultural resources.

Existing range improvements would be maintained only if they further the goal of protection, preservation, restoration, and enhancement of BENM objects and values.

Existing range improvements that are not consistent with the care and management of BENM objects and values would be removed. Where grazing is voluntarily or involuntarily reduced, permittees will assist the agencies in restoration of the allotments, by removing unused range improvements and infrastructure, capping unused or abandoned wells, taking measures to reduce or eliminate the spread of invasive species like cheatgrass and tamarisk, and any other restoration activities requested by the agencies and the BEC. This will ensure that any harm or damage to the land caused by the grazing activity of the permittees will be addressed by the permittees, and the cost of restoring such damage or harm will be born by the permittees, rather than by the public, unless the permittee can demonstrate to the Agencies that removal costs would be prohibitive.

Different from agency matrix

Row 42-

Avoid new water developments for livestock or other improvements that would intensify or concentrate livestock use anywhere on BENM. Grazing shall be managed so as to avoid soil erosion or damage to biological soil crust from the hooves of livestock and in a way that protects Tribal access to culturally important plants, including trees. (LMP p. 35). Grazing shall also be managed to preserve access to culturally important plants, including trees, for Tribal members. Grazing shall be managed to minimize or eliminate livestock waste from streams, springs, and other important riparian areas (LMP p. 35).

Different from agency matrix (agency matrix focused only on Babylon Allotment in this row).

Row 43-

The following areas would continue to be unavailable for grazing.

Areas mentioned in the proclamation:

- Bridger Jack Mesa
- Lavender Mesa
- Developed recreation sites- developed campsites
- Nine side canyons of Butler Wash
- Comb Wash side canyons (Mule Canyon)

- Arch Canyon, including Texas and Butts Canyons
- Fish Canyon
- Butler Wash

Additional areas:

- Mancos Mesa relict plant communities
- Mikes Canyon area, including the East and West Forks of Mike’s Canyon and Mike’s Mesa
- Canyon between Slickhorn Canyon and Point Lookout, from the head of the canyon to the San Juan River
- John’s Canyon
- Butler Wash from approximately (37.290302, -109.635362) down to the San Juan River
- Lower Indian Creek
- Indian Creek from Highway 211 to USFS boundary
- Indian Creek from USFS boundary south to Monument boundary (USFS)
- Cottonwood Creek south from Kelly Ranch and tributaries, including Hop Creek, Blue Creek, and Tuerto and Trough Canyons
- Beef Basin area canyons: South, Sweet Alice, Ruin, and Bull canyons
- Fable Valley
- Dark Canyon area, including Peavine, Woodenshoe, and Poison Canyons
- Mancos Mesa area canyons: Moki, North Gulch, Crystal Springs, Forgotten, Knowles, Cedar and Trail canyons
- Mike’s Canyon, East, Lake Canyon, Gray Mesa, Lone Pine, Lower Cedar, and Potato Hole pastures of the Lank Canyon Allotment
- All Mexican spotted owl Protected Activity centers
- Southwestern willow flycatcher designated critical habitat along the San Juan River
- North and South Sixshooter Mesas, and the adjacent mesa to the east
- Northern end of Harts Point, past the narrow neck of the mesa.
- Grand Gulch below Collins Canyon, all the Slickhorn Canyons, Mule Canyons north of US-95, Bullet Canyon above Jailhouse Ruin, Fish Creek Canyon from 2 miles upstream from Fish Creek and Owl Creek confluence, and Owl Canyon above Nevill’s Arch.

Additional areas may be allocated as unavailable for grazing pursuant to the Cultural Resources Implementation Plan and following the review of grazing monitoring and surveys required by this Plan, based on identified impacts to the cultural landscape of the BENM.

Different from agency matrix.

Row 44-

The following areas of the Indian Creek Unit would be limited to trailing (Appendix B Map B-2):

- Shay Canyon (boundary area identified for trailing and is not the Shay Canyon ACEC boundary)
- Indian Creek from Kelly Ranch vicinity to US Forest Service boundary (2020 MMP)
- Moki Canyon – Lower (below the fence downstream from the sand slide road access into Moki Canyon).

Same as Alternative C, same as Alternative D

Row 45-

The intention for areas unavailable (BLM)/not suitable (US Forest Service) for grazing would be to use natural topographic features (e.g., pour-offs, canyon walls, etc.) to the extent possible to mitigate direct adverse impacts to various resources (erosion etc.) from livestock. Where necessary to protect the cultural landscape and/or objects and values, fencing may be required to augment natural topographical boundaries.

Similar to alternative A

ADDITIONAL TO AGENCY MATRIX: Develop a formal drought management plan that is based on the best available western scientific information regarding climate change and any anticipated decline in precipitation, as well as Tribal ecological knowledge specific to the region and how its climate has changed (and responded to change) over time.

ADDITIONAL TO AGENCY MATRIX: 10-year (statutory) grazing permit renewals will include a site-specific compatibility analysis developed in coordination with the BEC. Tribal experience and expertise in managing domestic livestock grazing in the region shall be utilized in the development and application of the compatibility analysis.

Upon permit renewal, conduct a forage capacity analysis on each allotment based on habitat condition, degree of recovery where needed, recently measured forage production, and grazing use to determine accurate forage capacity and adjust AUMs if necessary.

ADDITIONAL TO AGENCY MATRIX: Range infrastructure must be maintained, including existing wells, and fences up and functional, before yearly turnout will be permitted. Infrastructure essential to the proper management of an allotment that is not in working order may be grounds for removal of animals from the allotment. All new fencing will utilize the most up-to-date wildlife-friendly specifications.

ADDITIONAL TO AGENCY MATRIX: The agencies and the BEC Tribes shall develop management prescriptions and enforcement standards for grazing, consistent with the cultural resources implementation plan.

No trespass grazing shall be permitted to continue in the BENM. Trespass or unauthorized

grazing will be addressed promptly after the issue has been identified, and the agencies shall notify the permittee of the trespass within 24 hours of the agencies' receipt of notice of unauthorized use. The permittee shall have 5 days to respond to the agencies with a plan to return the livestock to a non-trespass location. Branded domestic livestock identified to be in a trespass state will be impounded if not retrieved within one month of the permittee receiving notice of the trespass situation. Any unbranded domestic livestock can be impounded immediately.

ADDITIONAL TO AGENCY MATRIX: No allotments will be converted from cows and horses to domestic sheep or goats within at least a 10 mile buffer of bighorn sheep habitat and connectivity corridors to reduce risk of disease transmission. For any allotments proposed to be converted from cows or horses to domestic sheep or goats, the agencies will notify the BEC prior to any transfer being approved, so the BEC can provide Traditional Indigenous Knowledge to inform the decision about the proper care and management of bighorn sheep. The agencies will collaborate with the BEC and BEC Tribal teams to incorporate any Traditional Indigenous Knowledge regarding required separation or buffer zones to protect bighorn sheep.

ADDITIONAL TO AGENCY MATRIX: In collaboration with the BEC, develop a plan to address feral horses and other feral (formerly domestic) livestock that preserves access to forage, habitat, and water for culturally important wildlife species. This plan may require removal of feral animals from the BENM to allow access to adequate water, forage, and habitat for species listed in Proclamations 9558 and 10285, and other species identified as part of the cultural landscape of the BENM according to Tribal expertise and Traditional Ecological Knowledge.

ADDITIONAL TO AGENCY MATRIX: Day Use stock is allowed in Bullet Canyon from Grand Gulch to Jailhouse Ruin. Two miles upstream Fish Canyon from the confluence with Owl Canyon, McLoyd Canyon to impassable pour-off, and Owl Canyon to Nevill's Arch. Kane Gulch, Collins Canyon, Government Trail, Grand Gulch from Kane Gulch to Collins Canyon, Fish Creek Canyon from Comb Wash to confluence with Owl Canyon, Mule Canyon South of U-95, Road Canyon, Lime Creek Canyon, Johns Canyon, and Arch Canyon.

ADDITIONAL TO AGENCY MATRIX: Stock use, both day and overnight, is limited to no more than 1 overnight stock party at a time in any canyon on Cedar Mesa, and to only one stock trip at any time, day or overnight in Grand Gulch. Stock day use will be limited to 1 party per day per trailhead in all canyons requiring permits (except Grand Gulch and McLoyd). The BLM and BEC will monitor day use and the agency will implement a day-use allocation and reservation system at a future date, if the impacts of day-use visitation warrant.

ADDITIONAL TO AGENCY MATRIX: the Forest Service and BEC will collaborate to allocate stock use on Forest Service lands within the BENM to ensure that livestock do not

adversely impact cultural sites, including objects and values.

ADDITIONAL TO AGENCY MATRIX: Pack and stock animals are not allowed in cultural resource locations as identified by the BEC.